

# **History and Results of Labor**

## **Standard Initiatives**

**An Event History and Panel Analysis of the Ratification**

**Patterns, and Effects, of the International Labor Organization's**

**first Child Labor Convention**

**Dissertation by Dipl. Soz. Miriam Abu Sharkh**

**Evaluators:**

**Prof. Elwert, Prof. Meyer, Prof. Skarabis, Prof. Kohli, Prof. McAdam,  
Prof. Ramirez**

*Defended March 6, 2002*



I would like to thank all my advisors and friends who have helped me so profoundly through all the stresses and travails of my dissertation. First and foremost, I want to thank my mentor Prof. John Meyer who has taken endless hours to quickly and extensively answer my many questions and read dissertation drafts. All of his advice emails together could probably make-up their own dissertation. My gratitude also goes out to the other stressed members in my dissertation committee that had to rush through my dissertation with its long German-style sentences due to job market demands: Prof. Horst Skarabis, Prof. Elwert, Prof. Francisco Ramirez, Prof. McAdam, and, of course, Prof. Elwert. Furthermore, I am very indebted to my friends who spend much of their spare time in February 2002 proof-reading my manuscript or answering last minute inquiries. Many thanks to Viktoria Bergschmidt, Bryan Snyder, Irena Stephanikova, Kristóf Dávid Gosztonyi, Erik Kreider, and Max Erdstein.

**This dissertation is dedicated to my little sister Rebecca who admonished me every morning, hands on hips, at 6:30am to get-up with her and work on the “disperpation” as she called it.**

# Contents

INTRODUCTION .....	7
OUTLINE.....	10
<b>PART I.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>1. HISTORY AND CURRENT RELEVANCE OF PROTECTING CORE LABOR STANDARDS.....</b>	<b>12</b>
1.1. HISTORICAL DISCUSSION.....	12
1.2. CURRENT DISCUSSION.....	13
<b>2. FUNDAMENTAL LABOR AND SOCIAL STANDARDS: A DEFINITION.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>3. INITIATIVES AND STRATEGIES TO PROMOTE LABOR STANDARDS.....</b>	<b>16</b>
3.1. NON-GOVERNMENTAL INITIATIVES TO PROMOTE LABOR STANDARDS .....	17
3.1.1 <i>Typology of Non-Governmental Initiatives</i> .....	18
3.1.1.1. Ethical Trademarks and Codes of Conduct.....	18
3.1.1.2. Partner and Social Labels.....	19
3.1.2. <i>Differences between Non-Governmental Social Standard Initiatives</i> .....	20
3.1.2.1. Differences in Number and Extensivity of Social Standards Considered .....	20
3.1.2.2. Differences in Monitoring Models.....	22
3.1.2.2.1. Internal Monitoring: Company Monitoring and Agency Monitoring .....	23
3.1.2.2.2. External Monitoring: Independent and Foundation Monitoring .....	23
3.1.2.2.3. Limitations of Private Monitoring Models.....	24
3.1.3. <i>Summary: Advantages and Disadvantages of Non-Governmental Social Standard Initiatives</i> .....	25
3.2. GOVERNMENTAL INITIATIVES AND STRATEGIES TO PROMOTE LABOR STANDARDS.....	27
3.2.1. <i>National Strategies</i> .....	27
3.2.1.1. USA .....	27
3.2.1.2. Germany.....	29
3.2.2. <i>Regional Strategies</i> .....	29
Example: European Union.....	30
3.2.3. <i>Multilateral Strategies</i> .....	32
3.2.3.1. WTO .....	32
3.2.3.2. ILO.....	33
3.2.4. <i>Typology: Coercive versus Voluntary Multilateral Strategies</i> .....	35
3.2.4.1. Coercive Strategies and their Justifications .....	35
3.2.4.2. Voluntary Strategies and their Justifications.....	37
3.2.5. <i>Advantages and Disadvantages of Coercive and Voluntary Measures Measures or Methods? Positions of Social Scientists, NGOs, Trade Unions, and Governments</i> .....	39
3.2.5.1. Social Scientists .....	39
3.2.5.2. NGOs .....	39
3.2.5.3. Trade Unions.....	40
3.2.5.4. Governments .....	40
3.2.5.4.1. Developed Countries.....	40
3.2.5.4.2. Developing Countries .....	41
3.2.6. <i>New Developments</i> .....	43

<b>4. WHICH LABOR STANDARDS HAVE TO BE IMPLEMENTED REGARDLESS OF INTRA-NATIONAL FACTORS? A CRYSTALLIZING CONSENSUS .....</b>	<b>44</b>
4.1. THE CONSENSUS: AN OVERVIEW.....	44
4.2. SOCIAL STANDARDS AND FUNDAMENTAL LABOR STANDARDS AS DEFINED BY INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS .....	45
4.2.1. ILO.....	46
4.2.2. UN.....	47
4.2.3. WORLD BANK.....	47
4.2.4. OECD.....	48
<b>5. RECENT TRENDS IN CORE LABOR STANDARD DIMENSIONS .....</b>	<b>49</b>
5.1. THE BAN ON THE USAGE OF CHILD LABOR AS WELL AS LIMITATIONS ON YOUTH LABOR IN THE CASE OF HAZARDOUS WORK.....	49
5.2. THE RIGHT TO A FREE CHOICE OF EMPLOYMENT AND THE PROHIBITION OF SLAVE LABOR .....	52
5.3. THE RIGHT NOT TO BE DISCRIMINATED IN TRAINING, EMPLOYMENT, AND REMUNERATION.....	52
5.4. THE RIGHT OF ASSOCIATION AND THE RIGHTS TO FORM TRADE UNIONS AND BARGAIN COLLECTIVELY .....	53
<b>PART II.....</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>1. WHY FOCUS ON CHILD LABOR? .....</b>	<b>55</b>
1.1. DEFINITION OF “CHILD” AND “CHILD LABOR” .....	55
1.2. THEORETICAL APPROACH: THE WORLD SOCIETY THEORY AND ITS CONTESTANTS .....	58
<b>2. HYPOTHESIS.....</b>	<b>62</b>
2.1. RATIFICATIONS .....	62
2.2. (DE)COUPLING?: RATIFICATION AND STRUCTURAL CHANGE .....	67
<b>3. OPERATIONALIZATION, DATA, AND METHODS.....</b>	<b>74</b>
3.1. RATIFICATION PATTERNS: EVENT HISTORY ANALYSIS 1973-1995 .....	74
3.2. STRUCTURAL CHANGE: PANEL ANALYSIS 1960-1990 .....	77
<b>4. DISCUSSION .....</b>	<b>79</b>
4.1. RATIFICATIONS .....	79
4.1.1. <i>Overview: Few Ratifications</i> .....	79
4.1.2. <i>Cox-Models</i> .....	85
4.2. REDUCTION OF CHILD LABOR.....	88
<b>5. CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>94</b>

<b>PART III</b> .....	<b>95</b>
<b>1. TESTING DIFFERENT LINKAGES: THE LEVERAGE OF INTERNATIONAL NON-GOVERNMENTAL-ORGANIZATIONS AGAINST INTERNATIONAL GOVERNMENTAL-ORGANIZATIONS</b> .....	<b>95</b>
1.1. INTRODUCTION: WHICH KINDS OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS (IOs) ACCELERATE THE REDUCTION OF CHILD LABOR RATES? .....	95
1.2. (I)NGOS: HARBINGER OF SOCIAL PROGRESS? .....	99
<b>2. SOCIAL MOVEMENT LITERATURE REVIEW</b> .....	<b>102</b>
2.1. THE CLASSICAL THEORISTS: WEBER, MICHELS, ENGELS, MARX, DURKHEIM, AND LEBON.....	102
2.2. THE MODERN CLASSICS: PARK, LEBON, PARSONS, SMELSER, AND MÜHLMANN.....	106
2.3. NEW SOCIAL MOVEMENT THEORY (NSMT): CHANGING VALUES.....	109
2.4. RESOURCE MOBILIZATION THEORY (RMT) .....	117
2.5. THE POLITICAL PROCESS MODEL (PPM): INJUSTICE FRAMEWORKS .....	122
<b>3. DEFINITIONS</b> .....	<b>125</b>
3.1.(I) NGOS.....	125
3.2. SOCIAL MOVEMENT .....	126
<b>4. OPERATIONALIZING A SOCIAL MOVEMENT</b> .....	<b>129</b>
4.1 INTERNALLY CORRELATIVE INDICATORS OF A SOCIAL MOVEMENT: ORGANIZATIONS AS STATUTORY MANIFESTATIONS OF A SOCIAL MOVEMENT .....	129
4.2 EXCURSION: INDICATORS AND THE PROBLEMS OF CASING .....	132
<b>5. HYPOTHESIS: THE SUCCESS OF THE UNRULY</b> .....	<b>136</b>
<b>6. SAMPLE AND DATA ANALYSIS: SUBJECTING NATIONS TO AN EVENT HISTORY AND PANEL ANALYSIS</b> .....	<b>139</b>
<b>7. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION: DAVID AGAINST GOLIATH</b> .....	<b>140</b>
<b>8. CONCLUSION: THE RADICAL FLANK EFFECT</b> .....	<b>143</b>
<b>OVERALL CONCLUSION AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS</b> .....	<b>144</b>
<b>LITERATURE</b> .....	<b>147</b>
<b>APPENDIX</b> .....	<b>183</b>