

Lives on the Edge

An Analysis of the Causes for Widespread Poverty Among American Single Mothers in the Post-Welfare-Reform Years

Inaugural-Dissertation zur Erlangung der Doktorwürde
am Fachbereich Geschichts- und Kulturwissenschaften
John F. Kennedy Institut für Nordamerikastudien
Freie Universität Berlin



Vorgelegt von:
Stefania Tafuro
aus Bologna, Italien

Erstgutachter: Prof. Dr. Knud Krakau
Zweitgutachter: Prof. Dr. Ursula Lehmkuhl

Berlin, im Juni 2005
Disputation: 27. April 2006

Questa storia che ho intrapreso a scrivere
è ancora più difficile di quanto io non pensassi...
L' arte di scriver [storie] sta nel saper tirar fuori
da quel nulla che si è capito della vita tutto il resto,
ma finita la pagina si riprende la vita
e ci s' accorge che quel che si sapeva è proprio un nulla.

I. Calvino, *Il Cavaliere Inesistente* (Torino: Einaudi, 1959).

Acknowledgments

In researching and writing this thesis, numerous people offered their assistance and knowledge, helping me to bring this project to fruition.

In Los Angeles, Rocio Cordoba and Sophie Fanelli at the American Civil Liberties Union of Southern California were generous with their time. Both our conversations about women's ability to fully exercise their reproductive freedoms, and Rocio and Sophie's willingness to let me help them with some of the law suits that they were preparing to file provided first-hand perspectives on the lives and daily struggles of welfare recipients in California.

At the California Women's Law Center, all the staff was extremely helpful over the two and a half years that I spent doing research at their office. I am particularly indebted to Paula Pearlman, Abby Liebman, Marjorie Sims, and Susan Berke Fogel. Paula first alerted me to the existence of the Center and about the possibility to continue my research work there. She never ceased to encourage me on my path, and treated me with a kindness and friendship that touched me deeply. Abby equipped me with a workstation at the Law Center and allowed me to access all the materials at hand. Both her contagious energy and her dedication to her work and to her two adopted children were a source of great inspiration. Marjorie, who always gave me the feeling that my research project was worth the effort, patiently answered my many questions about her professional experience in the public interest sector. Her integrity, her commitment to secure justice to women, and her broad and friendly smile are a much cherished memory. Susan provided me with more help than I could possibly ever thank her for. It was under Susan's tutelage that I become truly familiar with reproductive rights issues in the United States and in California. She coached me through assignments that facilitated the task to research the causes of widespread poverty among single mothers and that later contributed to enrich the final version of this manuscript. Also, Susan opened up her personal archive to me, allowing me to become acquainted with over ten years of exciting advocacy work and legal battles fought both on state and federal level on behalf of women. Fi-

nally, she sat down with me on numerous occasions to discuss the progress of my research work and to help me give to the dissertation its current shape and scope. This project would not have happened without Susan's invaluable insight and experience. Her generosity towards me, a perfect stranger from Europe when I first stepped into her office, has been truly impressive.

At the Free University of Berlin, I am particularly indebted to my advisor Prof. Dr. Knud Krakau, who gave me the possibility and honor to become one of his graduate students. Our conversations about American Constitutional Law and Prof. Krakau's numerous precious advises and contributions to this project have greatly enhanced both my personal understanding of the American society and its values and the final version of this work.

Finally, I can not imagine having undertaken this project without the help of my family. My mom, my dad, and my grandparents have supported me over the last eight years in the same way they have throughout my life, with encouragement and love that have no end. A very special thank goes to my husband Claus, who besides being the most loving being that I have ever met, patiently proofread large portions of the manuscript, taught me all I know about computers, computer programs, and operating systems, and has been my best friend throughout it all.

Contents

Acknowledgments	i
Foreword	1
Introduction	7
1 Media Imaging of Welfare-Reliant Women	17
1.1 Race, Class, and Gender Issues in Social Welfare History . . .	17
1.1.1 The Great Depression, Male Unemployment, and the Social Security Act	22
1.1.2 Chaste Widows and Moral Fitness Standards	24
1.1.3 The Civil Rights Movement and Mandatory Work Re- quirements	29
1.1.4 The 1970's, 1980's and Early 1990's	32
1.2 Clarabel Ventura's Style of Welfare: A Problem of Represen- tation	33
1.3 The Image We Should See	38
2 The End of Welfare as We Know It	45
2.1 The Welfare Reform Bill and its Reproductive Rights Agenda	46
2.1.1 "Cut Down on Out-of-Wedlock Births, Win Cash" ¹ .	48
2.1.2 Abstinence and Sex Education Programs	53
2.2 The Child Exclusion Provision	55
2.2.1 Welfare Myths v Welfare Facts	58
2.2.2 The Impact of State Child Exclusion Policies on the Lives of Welfare-reliant Mothers and their Children . .	61
2.2.3 Child Exclusion in State Courts	63
2.2.4 Caps on Kids: What Do State Evaluations Tell Us About Child Exclusion Policies?	69

2.2.5	Is There Any Evidence that Child Exclusion Policies Affect Recipients' Attitudes Towards Childbearing? . . .	72
2.3	After Welfare: The Second-Shift Moms	74
3	Affordable, Good-Quality Child Care: A Cornerstone to Working Women	81
3.1	Federal Financing for Child Care: A Historical Overview . . .	86
3.1.1	The Beginnings of Other-Than-Mother Care: Day Nursery and Nursery School Movements	86
3.1.2	Child Care in the Years Following the Great Depression: 1933-1943	88
3.1.3	We Can Do It! But Not Without Child Care: Working Mothers and the War Effort, 1942-1946	89
3.1.4	Child Care as a Response to War: A Summary	92
3.1.5	Lyndon Johnson's War on Poverty and the Head Start Program	93
3.1.6	'A Matter of Right': Child Care Between 1971 and 1988	96
3.1.7	Reversing Direction on Public Financing for Child Care Services: The 1980s	97
3.1.8	The Need for Universal Subsidized Child Care Services: The 1990s	100
3.2	Current Types of Child Care Arrangements	103
3.2.1	Family Child Care	105
3.2.2	Center-based Care	106
3.3	Assessing the Overall Need for Child Care Services Between 1990 and 1996	107
3.3.1	Availability of Child Care Services: 1990-1995	108
3.3.2	Affordability of Child Care Services: 1990-1995	113
3.3.3	Quality of Child Care Services: 1990-1995	116
3.3.4	Summary of Child Care Availability, Affordability and Quality Between 1990 and 1995	121
3.4	Welfare Reform and Changes in Federal Financing for Child Care Services	123
3.5	Characteristics of the Child Care Market After the Passage of the Welfare Reform Bill	126
3.5.1	Availability of Child Care Services Between 1996 and 2001	127
3.5.2	Affordability of Child Care Services Between 1996 and 2001	131
3.5.3	Quality of Child Care Services Between 1996 and 2001	133

3.5.4	Summary of Child Care Availability, Affordability and Quality: 1996-2001	136
3.6	Effects of Child Care Shortage on Working Families and Their Children	138
4	Reproductive Health Care: A Casualty of Hospital Mergers	143
4.1	The Size and Scope of Religious Health Care Systems	145
4.2	Protecting Access to Reproductive Health Care at Merged Institutions and in Managed-Care Scenarios	150
4.3	Merger Mania: The End of Choice?	157
4.3.1	Emergency Abortion	161
4.3.2	Extrauterine or Ectopic Pregnancy	164
4.3.3	Hospital Care of Rape Survivors and Dispensation of Emergency Contraception	167
4.3.4	Permanent Planning: Sterilization Procedures ²	176
4.3.5	Brackenridge Hospital: A Case Study	182
4.4	Safeguarding Access: Advocacy Efforts to Preserve Reproductive Health Care Services	184
4.4.1	When Community Action Works: Blocked Mergers and Creative Compromises	191
4.5	Impact of Mergers on Local Communities: A Summary	195
5	America's Teenagers, Pregnancy and Public Policy	201
5.1	Liberal and Conservative Positions in the Ongoing Debate Over Teenage Pregnancy	206
5.2	What The Ongoing Debate On Teenage Pregnancy Conflates and Ignores	211
5.3	Economic Hardship and Cultural Ambivalence	214
5.3.1	Cultural Ambivalence in Federal and State Policies	219
5.3.2	Abstinence Education Programs: The Government Response to an Epidemic	228
5.3.3	Is Abstinence Education Working?	233
5.4	Formulating More Effective Policies: Six Critical Steps	235
5.4.1	Addressing the Need for More Systematic Research	236
5.4.2	Securing Minors' Access to Birth Control Methods	239
5.4.3	Improving Educational Opportunities and Reducing Dropouts	243
5.4.4	Protecting the Rights of Pregnant and Parenting Teens	245
5.4.5	Parenting Teens and Childcare	248

5.4.6	Girls' Participation in Sports as a Tool to Prevent Teen Pregnancy	249
5.5	Teenagers' Reproductive Health and Sexual Behavior: A Summary	251
5.6	Early Motherhood as a Form of Empowerment	256
	Conclusion	259
	Abbreviations	267
	Literature Cited	273
	Legal References	293
	A Collection of Images	297
	B Deutsche Zusammenfassung (Summary in German)	305
	C Lebenslauf	313