Educator Activists:
Bridging Transnational Advocacy and Community Mobilisation - Learning from Movement Organisers in the South

Autor
Malgi Prasad Reddy(M.A.)
Faculty of Education and Psychology at the Freie Universität Berlin

Disputed on 15 July, 2005

First Evaluator: Univ. - Prof. Dr. Gerd Hoff
Second Evaluator: Univ.- Prof. Dr. Christoph Wulf
Contents

0.0  Introduction
Sustainable Theory and Action for South - North Co-operation: A Transcultural Educational Task  1

Chapter One
Reconstructing the Research Process:
Methodological Considerations  12

1.0  Introduction: Research Paradigms and Strategies of Interpretation  12

1.1  The Philosophy: Participatory Action Research  12

1.2  Techniques of Grounded Theory and Software Supported Qualitative Analysis  15

1.3  From Ground Realities to Grounded Theory  16
1.3.1  Life-Stories from the Field
1.3.2  Grassroots Voices

1.4  Other Methodological Works Consulted  19

1.5  Conceptual Density  19

1.6  Determining Successive Phases of Inquiry  20

1.7  Sources  21
1.7.1  Technical and Non-Technical Literature
1.7.1.1  Interviews
1.7.1.2  Observations as Facilitator of Transnational Workshops and Anti-bias Trainings
1.7.1.3  Publicity Material, Occasional Publications and Websites

1.8  Sampling  24
1.8.1  Rules of Transcription and Anonymity of Interview Participants

1.9  Using Literature  27

1.10  Using Interviews: Variables, Coded Segments and Complex Kinds of Retrievals  27
1.10.1  Profiles of Interviewees through Variables
1.10.1.1  Constructing a Profile
1.10.2  The Coding system
1.10.2.1  Complex Retrievals
1.10.3  The Interview Process
1.10.3.1  Person and Process Oriented Questions
1.11 From Text to Theory: Data Analysis procedures and The Final Tale ..................................36
1.11.1 Theoretical Sensitivity
1.11.1.1 Sources of Theoretical Sensitivity

1.12 Developing a Conditional Matrix around Educator Activism ...........................................39

1.13 Intermediate Conclusion: Arriving at the Central Themes ..........42

Chapter Two
Transnational Advocacy Networks: Strengths and Crises ..........44

2.0 Introduction..................................................................................................................44
2.0.1 Transnational Advocacy Networks

2.1 Globalisation ..............................................................................................................47
2.1.1 Globalisation and Development Work
2.1.1.1 Economic Globalisation and Continuing Colonialism
2.1.2 Global Systems Theory
2.1.2.1 The Three Spheres of the Global System
2.1.3 Globalisation as an Ideology: Cultural or Economic?
2.1.3.1 Neo-colonialism Through Transcorporatism

2.2 Mechanism for Marginalisation:
Feminist Critique of the Economic Narrative .................................................................56
2.2.1 The Notion of Continuous Flow or the Trickle Down Effect
2.2.1.1 Economic Internationalisation
2.2.2.1 Concentration of Power, Control and Appropriation of Profits

2.3 Economic Globalisation and People.............................................................................60
2.3.1 Challenges to identity Formation
2.3.1.1 Globalisation obliterates Identities
2.3.1.2 Identity formation in the context of Globalisation
2.3.1.3 Three General Processes of Identity Exploration and Integration

2.4 Culture in the Transnational Corporate World ..................................................................68
2.4.1 Cultural Difference
2.4.2 Re-linking Economic Globalisation and Culture
2.4.2.1 Towards a Discursive Understanding of Culture

2.5 Concepts and Praxis of Development Work .................................................................73
2.5.1 Tensions between Advocates in the South and the North
2.5.1.1 Development Work Vs Human Rights: Two Conflicting Paradigms
2.5.1.2 Blaming the South: Culturalising Unequal South-North Relationships
2. 5.1.2.1 Controls Through Bureaucracy and Professionalisation

2.5.1.2.2 Control Over Material/Financial Resources

2.5.1.2.2.1 Help or Structural Transformation: Motivations behind funding the South

2.5.1.2.2.1.1 Return of the Helper Syndrome

2.5.1.2.2.1.2 Selective Funding: Northern, Christian and Governmental Overseas Development Aid

2.5.1.2.2.2 The Aid Business: Differential Valuing of Southern Services

2.5.1.2.2.2.1 Middle Men: Instruments for Implementing Financial Controls Co-opting the Southern Elite

2.5.1.2.2.3 Alternatives to Financial Relationships

2.5.2 Control over Knowledge Resources

2.5.2.1 The Politics of Knowing the South

2.5.2.1.1 Middle Class Concepts

2.6 The Post-development Critique

2.6.1 Production of Abnormal Subjects: A Negative Picture of the South

2.6.1.1 Negative Campaigning for Donations: Production of the Negative South

2.6.1.2 Negative Images of the South in Literature, Media and Text Books

2.7 Continuation of Colonialism-Ideology of White Superiority

2.7.1 Continuing Colonisation on Various Levels

2.8 Southernism: Beyond Orientalism

2.8.1 Defining Southernism

2.8.1.1 Remembering the South and Forgetting Northern History

2.8.2 *Southernism* in South-North Advocacy Work

2.9 Intermediate Conclusion:
The Two Legitimation Crises of TNANs

Chapter Three
Learning from the Grassroots: Educator Activism

3.0 Introduction

3.1 Action Potential in Theory

3.1.1 Theorists and Practitioners - Educators and Activists: The False Dichotomy

3.1.1.1 Action Potential in Theory

3.1.1.1.1 Conflicting Interpretations of Theory and Knowledge

3.1.1.2 Conflict over access to Resources and Authority

3.2 Approaches to Educator Activism: Some Pointers

3.2.1 Educator Activists: An Emerging Concept

3.2.1.1 Traditional and Organic Intellectuals

3.2.1.2 Public Intellectuals

3.2.1.3 Movement Intellectuals and Established Intellectuals:
Cognitive Praxis

3.2.1.3.1 Breaking the Scholarship-Commitment Borders

3.3 Need for Educator Activists

3.4 Adult Development Journey:
From Academics to Educator Activists

3.4.1 The Social Requirements of Identity Formation
3.4.1.1 Identities of Doing – Identity and Political Action
3.4.2 Identity and Life Cycle
3.4.2.1 Identity, Horizon and Orientation
3.4.3 A Project of defending one’s Subjecthood
3.4.4 Post-Colonial Knowledge and Identity Development
3.4.4.1 Developing Counter-Consciousness

3.5 Ambedkar and the Dalit Movement:
Lessons for Educator Activists

3.5.1 Caste System and Untouchability in India
3.5.1.1 Dalit and Non-Dalit Explanations of Untouchability
3.5.1.1.1 Religious Legitimation vs. Historical-Materialist Resistance
3.5.1.1.2 Conflicting Approaches to fighting Untouchability
3.5.1.1.2.1 Splinter Groups: Elitist, Christian and Grassroots Approaches
3.5.1.1.2.1.1 Picturing Ambedkar as an Educator Activist
3.5.2 Ideology of Dalit Liberation
3.5.2.1 Dalits as Agents of their own Liberation
3.5.2.2 Grassroots Advocacy and Mobilisation
3.5.2.2.1 Bottom Up Approach to Advocacy
3.5.2.2.1.1 Consciousness, Organisation and Struggle
3.5.3 The Protest Strategies
3.5.3.1 From Local to Transnational

3.6 Illustrating the Journey to becoming an Educator Activist

3.6.1 Exposure to Poverty and Discrimination
3.6.1.1 Dalit Discrimination in Contemporary Times
3.6.1.1.1 Motivated by being Witnesses to the Exploitation of Others
3.6.1.2 Familial and Societal Influences
3.6.1.3 Institutional Influences
3.6.4.1.1 Effects of Transnational Exposure on Educator Activism Today

3.7 Summarising the Identity-building Project:
Characteristics of Educator Activists

3.7.1 Conscious Building of Identity
3.7.2 Changing Perspectives: Combining Theory and Praxis
3.7.3 Empathy and Commitment to the Grassroots
3.7.3.1 Other Prominent References to Characteristics of Educator Activists
3.8 Working Definition of an Educator Activist ........................................169
3.8.1 Stages in the Developmental Journey Towards Educator Activism
3.8.1.1 The Academics
3.8.1.2 The Intellectuals
3.8.1.3 The Educators
3.8.1.4 Educator Activists
3.8.2 Sources and Levels of Learning and Areas of Action
3.8.3 A Continuous Journey
3.8.3.1 An Arduous Journey

Intermediate Conclusion ..................................................................................176

Chapter Four
Learning from the South: Non-Discriminatory Advocacy ................................178

4.0 Introduction: Facets Of Learning From The South............................178
4.0.1 Orientalism, Southernism and Learning from the South
Unlearning Discrimination and Undoing
Discriminatory Power Structures
4.0.2 Unlearning Southernism
4.0.2.1 The North as the Other

4.1 Transnational Advocacy:
Epistemological South-North Relationship ........................................183
4.1.1 Dominant- Dominated Power Relations are Learnt Behaviours
4.1.2 Neglecting Positive Contribution Of The Oppressed
4.1.3 From Trait to Process Geographies

4.2 Mythologisation of the South: Result of the Parochial
and Paternalistic Epistemology of the North ........................................188
4.2.1 northern development discourse and its southern images
4.2.1.1 Problem Based vis-a-vis a Critical Approach to the South
4.2.1.2 Anxieties of Researchers in the South
4.2.2 Agency of the Oppressed
4.2.2.1 Putting The Poor First
4.2.2.1.1 Southern Sites of Collective Political Activity
4.2.2.1.1.1 Conflict Between International and Local Representations
4.2.2.2 Cultural and Political Appropriation of Migrant Expertise

4.3 Learning S-N Co-operation: Intercultural Development
Education-Current Assumptions and Future Alternatives ...............201
4.3.1 Southern Vs Northern Paradigms of Intercultural Development
Education
4.3.1.1 Qualifying Northern Professionals for Helping the South
4.3.1.1.1 Assumptions about the Sources of Problems and Conflicts
4.3.1.1.2 Assumptions about what needs to Change
4.3.1.1 Assumptions about who needs Intercultural Education for Just S-N Relations
4.3.1.1.4 Working with Southern Counterparts and Migrant Experts
4.3.1.1.5 Goals of Intercultural Development Education
4.3.1.1.6 Methods and Content
4.3.1.1.7 Trainer Qualification for Intercultural Development Education
4.3.2 Implementing The Southern Paradigm: Hindrances And Opportunities
4.3.2.1 The Hindrances
4.3.2.1.1 Undue Focus upon the Oppressed and not challenging the Oppressors or Factors Leading to Oppression
4.3.2.1.2 Ghettoising the feelings/Activities of the Oppressed
4.3.2.1.3 Non- Dialogical Approach
4.3.2.1.4 Dialoguing Deeper S-N Political And Social Power Relationships
4.3.2.1.5 Institutional Controls Over Intercultural Development Training
4.3.2.2 Possibilities for Putting the Southern Paradigm into Practise
4.3.2.2.1 Outward Vs Inward Looking Development Education
4.3.2.2.2 Learning from the Inside and Outside
4.3.2.2.2.1 Development Research And Action “With” And Not “About” Or “For” The South
4.3.2.2.2.2 Transnational Development Studies
4.3.3.3 Participatory Social Science Research

4.4 Developing A Pedagogy For The North

4.4.1 Challenges For Actors In The South And The North
4.4.2 Stages and Phases of Learning from the South
4.4.2.1 Stages Of Learning From The South.
4.4.2.2 Phases of Learning from the South
4.4.2.2.1 Denial Of Oppression
4.4.2.2.2 Oppressor-Oppressed Contradiction
4.4.2.2.3 Critical Dialogue
4.4.2.2.4 Liberative Co-Operation
4.4.2.3 Continuous Co-educational Learning Process
4.4.3 The Oppressed Dalits as Educators – An Excursus
4.4.3.1 Dalits as Subjects of their own Liberation
4.4.3.1.1 Can the Subalterns Advocate Transnationally?
4.4.4 Learning from the South, Educator Activism and Advocacy from Below

4.5 Certain Conclusions

4.5.1 Demythologise the South
4.5.2 De -legitimising Dominant Discourses
4.5.3 Self-Reflection On The Part Of Advocacy Workers From The North
4.5.4 Deconstructing the Donor-Recipient Relationship
4.5.5 Including Migrant Experts in Northern Project Staff
4.5.6 Southern Confidence
4.5.7 Definition, Requirements And Long Term Effects Of Learning From The South
Chapter Five
Push-Pull-Balance: Findings and Suggestions for Future Research and Action

5.0 Introduction ..................................................................................................................244

5.1 Towards a Push-Pull-Balance Model for Transnational Development Work: The Overall Finding ..................................................................................................................245

5.1.1 Push-Pull-Balance: Model of South-North Relationships: Transformative Pedagogy From the Periphery

5.1.1.1 Phases in the Push-Pull-Balance Model

5.1.1.1.1 PUSH: Pushing the Periphery to the Centre

5.1.1.1.2 PULL: Pulling the Centre to the Periphery

5.1.1.1.3 BALANCE: Dynamic S-N Relationship

5.2 Understanding the Push-Pull-Balance Dynamic: Particular Findings of the Study .................................................................................................................................250

5.2.1 Globalisation, Advocacy and Tensions between Southern and Northern Advocates

5.2.1.1 Development and Duplicity

5.2.1.2 Getting Rid of the Middlemen

5.2.1.3 Governmental Aid Programmes sans Activism

5.2.1.4 Sceptic Views on Northern Advocacy

5.2.1.4.1 Disinterested Church Advocacy

5.2.1.4.2 Critique of Advocacy Concepts Devised by the North for the South

5.2.1.4.3 Controlling form of Advocacy

5.2.1.4.4 Closed and Open NGOs

5.2.1.4.5 Advocacy by the Victims Themselves

5.2.2 Educator Activism: Characteristics and Tasks of Educator Activists

5.2.2.1 Educator Activists are not Born, They Become

5.2.2.1.1 Conscious Building of Identity: A Story from the North

5.2.2.1.2 Identity Formation and Socialisation of the Oppressed: A Story from the South

5.2.2.1.3 Qualities of an Educator Activist

5.2.3 Learning from the South

5.2.3.1 Learning from the South OR South-North Co-operative Learning: The Dilemma

5.2.4 Pedagogical Aspects

5.2.4.1 Learning Material: Need to recognise minorities both as topic and subject

5.2.4.1.1 Transformative Adult Education

5.2.4.1.1.1 Implementing Transformative Adult Education
5.3 Suggestions For Future Research And Action ............................270

5.3.1 Sharing Knowledge Resources
5.3.1.1 Thematise Oppression and Domination
5.3.1.2 South-North Collaboration: Differentiated and Positive Publications Regarding the South
5.3.1.3 Critical Application of Literature about the South
5.3.1.4 Enabling Activists to theorise their Experiences and Theorists to Find Spaces for Activism

5.3.2 Creative Form of Advocacy
5.3.3 Check-list for South-North Organisations to Examine their Organisations’ Policies vis-a-vis Educator Activism and Learning from the South
5.3.3.1 Questions to NGOs in the South
5.3.3.2 Questions to Funding Agencies/Development NGOs in the North
5.3.3.3 Questions to Northern, Governmental Development Aid Agencies

5.4 Intermediate Conclusion .................................................................278

Chapter Six
Final Conclusion ...........................................................................279

Bibliography .................................................................................285

Clarification of Terms ....................................................................315

Abbreviations Used .........................................................................316

List of Tables and Illustrations ....................................................317

Summary in German

Appendices

Appendix 1
Appendix 2
Appendix 3
Appendix 4
Abstract

This dissertation establishes the basic arguments for: the need to cultivate identities as educator activists; learning from the South and related educational and pedagogical aspects. One may object to this initiative, arguing that most people involved in transnational advocacy issues are aware of S-N inequalities and, therefore, it is anachronistic and superfluous to talk of such issues. The aim here is not to contradict the presence of such awareness. It is, rather, an invitation to search for alternative, just and co-operative ways that would reduce such inequalities. Therefore, it is not old fashioned, anachronistic or unrealistic to talk of S-N inequalities. If such a search is not undertaken, it would amount to a blatant denial of centuries of oppression undergone by the South and a neglect of the injustices imposed by the knowledge and economic structures of western colonialism. Implementing Southern alternatives to dominant Northern viewpoints helps co-operative, S-N efforts counter the continuing colonialism in the name of “one-world”, “world economy” or “multilateralism”.

Those involved in south-north development co-operation and the related educational and training structures need to develop an educator activist identity through a conscious effort to involve oneself at the grassroots level and not just remain mere theorists or mere activists. Current developmental efforts from the North in the South, owing to unequal power and financial relations between the “developed” and “developing” world, are in need of improved structures and ways that lead to more just and sustained transnational advocacy and action. Sustained rhetoric of politicians and the media produces and propagates an image of the South as “needy, violent, chaotic and helpless” in both governmental and non-governmental developmental circles in the North, mainly United States and central Europe. There is a need for a more differentiated and fine-tuned image of the South. What can the North learn from the South in order to improve development co-operation? What is the relationship of Northern individuals and institutions with the migrant intellectuals, experts and practitioners living in their midst? What kind of educational and training material and methodologies are needed to increase this participatory and transnational efforts to facilitate south-north developmental work on a more equal footing?

Using the philosophy of Participatory Action research and the techniques of Grounded Theory methodology the Dissertation qualitatively analyses 29 problem-centred interviews with theorists and practitioners in India and Germany. A concrete example of a current, intensive social movement in India, the Dalit Movement, is highlighted as providing good learning material for Southern and Northern theorists and activists.

The findings of the Dissertation will be useful both for theorists and practitioners in the field of development co-operation in the South and in the North. Practical educational and training methodologies and ideas in the field of transnational advocacy and practise are suggested for future implementation by governmental and non-governmental institutions. New avenues of thinking are opened up to fill the lacuna in learning and communicating methods for all stakeholders searching for sustainable ways to South-North learning.
Brücken zwischen sozialkritischer Theorie, Advocacy Arbeit und Basisbewegungen: Von Bewegungsorganisator/innen im Süden Lernen

Autor: Prasad Reddy

Abstract
Die Zentrale These des Promotionsvorhabens ist, dass die Steigerung der politischen Partizipation und die Stärkung zivilgesellschaftlicher Strukturen die Entwicklung eines politischen Identifikationsmodells voraussetzt. Dies soll am Beispiel von Bildungsengagierte ausgeführt werden, und zwar anhand der Fragestellung, wie diese sozial-politische Theorien und Praxis verbinden. Durch diese Verbindung - so eine andere These der Arbeit - intensiviert sich die politische Beteiligung von Theoretiker/innen und vertieft sich der theoretische Hintergrund der Basisbewegungen, wodurch Mobilisierungseffekte entstehen können.

Die Trennung zwischen Theorie und Aktion selbst ist ein Phänomen des Abendlandes, ein schwer zu durchbrechender Diskurs. Ausgangspunkt des Vorhabens ist die Beobachtung, dass in Europa und den USA sehr gute wissenschaftliche Analysen zu sozio-politischen Problemen existieren, die sozialen Bewegungen und politischen Basisorganisationen aber nach den 80er Jahren viel an Größe und Durchsetzungskraft verloren haben. Im Süden, der sogenannten „Dritten Welt“ dagegen gibt es eher die Tendenz, dass Aktion entweder der Theorie voraus geht, oder Hand in Hand mit ihr. Sozialkritische Theorie ist hier eher das Produkt des Engagements, das sich den Problemen des Überlebens an der Basis stellt.


Foreword

Writing a dissertation is often considered an intellectual exercise. However, a lot of my practical, life experience and lessons learnt, thereby, have gone into this research project. Significant among these experiences are my pursuits, along with family, friends and colleagues, to dream of and work to realize a form of life where humans, especially those holding unprivileged access to financial, knowledge and military powers, could realize their common origins and devise ways to build and maintain peaceful and just relationships, even in and out of times of chaos.

While I am thankful to all who supported me during the project, I mention some in person here. Personal and professional sharing has been intense and deep with my wife, Anita. Thanks to her for her challenging thoughts and practical help that accompanied throughout this research process. I wish also to thank Prof. Gerd Hoff, my first guide for his constant support during the last seven years-right form the time I began finding my way into German University circles. His probing questions regarding various aspects of my dissertation helped enrich my work. Prof. Christoph Wulf, my second guide, deserves a special thanks for his critical and creative thoughts and hints to improve my work.

Christine Boyd and Dorothea Giesche need to be specially thanked for their patient reading, correction and comments of my final draft. Regina Frey was of immense help while I was formulating this research project. Helga Fontanive patiently transcribed all the German interviews, without which I would have needed much more time in bringing this work to completion. I thank Eric van Grasdorff, my good friend for his immense help with literature and discussion around Participatory Action Research. Mark Einig, Nadja Bliel, among other colloquium-colleagues at the Freie Universität, Berlin, need special thanks for the support I received during our regular colloquium sessions.

I express my heartfelt thanks for all the interview participants who took time and energy to discuss various issues with me. To protect their anonymity, I wish not to mention any of their names. Professors Sharit Bhowmik and Sukdeo Thorat helped me a lot during my research stay in India in 2003. As always thanks to Thelma and Ravi Narayan of the Community health Cell for their help with creative, networking abilities. Emotional and warm support was constantly awarded me by my Family: my Mother, brothers and sisters at home in India and my in-laws Helga and Kurt Fontanive in Germany. Special thanks for my brother, Santhosh Reddy, for supplying me with important, actual literature regarding the Dalit Movement.

Without the three year scholarship from the Heinrich Boll Foundation, Berlin, it would have been impossible to have brought this project to an end. One person was always, always beside me, all through these three years of my scholarship: she was born when I started receiving the scholarship and now, as I end the project, she is three years old. Thanks for coming into our world, my dear daughter, Anoka! Myself, and all the persons I mentioned above, promise you that we will continue to work to make your world ever more livable and loveable!

Prasad Reddy
Bonn, 25 July, 2005