

Ute Luig

# Approaching the Sacred. Pilgrimage in Historical and Intercultural Perspective

## Summary

The aim of the volume is a comparative study of non-European pilgrimages under different historical conditions and changing power relations. Historic transformations but also continuities in organization, bodily and spiritual experience, as well as individual and collective motives are discussed. Written by an interdisciplinary group of authors, their various disciplinary perspectives offer insight into the differences in methods, theoretical reflections and the use and meanings of objects in ritual performances. The construction of sacred spaces as landscapes of imagination reflects a wide range of meaning in regard of the growing complexity and social dynamism in times of postmodernity.

Keywords: Interdisciplinary approach; non-European pilgrimages; transformation and continuity; theories of pilgrimage studies

Ziel des Bandes ist eine vergleichende Analyse außereuropäischer Pilgerreisen unter verschiedenen historischen Bedingungen und Machtverhältnissen. Untersucht werden historische Transformationsprozesse, aber auch Kontinuitäten bezüglich der Organisation, der körperlichen und spirituellen Erfahrungen sowie der individuellen und kollektiven Motive der Pilger. Die interdisziplinäre Zusammensetzung der Autoren vermittelt Einblicke in unterschiedliche Methoden, theoretische Reflektionen sowie den Gebrauch und die Bedeutung von Objekten in rituellen Performances. Die Konstruktion von heiligen Orten als Landschaften der Imagination reflektiert eine große Vielfalt an Bedeutungen in Bezug auf die komplexen und dynamischen Prozesse im Zeitalter der Postmoderne.

Keywords: Interdisziplinäre Arbeit; nicht-europäische Pilgerschaft; Wandel und Kontinuität; Theorien der Studien zur Pilgerschaft

The idea for this book originated from the Excellence Cluster, *Topoi, The Formation and Transformation of Space and Knowledge in Ancient Civilizations*, (C-III, acts). As an interdisciplinary group of pre-and protohistorians, classical and musical archaeologists and social anthropologists, we shared a common interest in the construction of sacred spaces and

Ute Luig (ed.) | Approaching the Sacred. Pilgrimage in Historical and Intercultural Perspective | Berlin Studies of the Ancient World 49 (ISBN 978-3-9818369-3-6; ISSN (Print) 2366-6641; ISSN (Online) 2366-665X; URN urn:nbn:de:kobv:188-fudocsdocument00000027524-4) | [www.edition-topoi.org](http://www.edition-topoi.org)

ritual landscapes in different historical and cultural settings. Our main aim was to understand the entanglement of physical space with social acts, images, material objects and its transformation into sacred or sacralised space. The understanding of long term processes of transformations, of continuities as well as discontinuities went hand in hand with the problematization of methods and terminology in an interdisciplinary context. Although only a fraction of the group (Hammerschmied, Kubatzki, Schäfer, Luig) is represented in this volume, the engaged discussions we had for three years played an important role in the conception of the present book. I thank my former colleagues Sven Hansen, Ortwin Dally and Ricardo Eichmann for a time of fruitful cooperation and the administration of Topoi for its financial and organisational support. John Eade was an inspiring and diligent critic and I am grateful for the time he put into this project. The printing of this book which was beset with some time consuming difficulties was made possible by the painstaking engagement of Gisela Eberhardt and Hanna Erftenbeck, with the production process and the support of Carla Dietzel who helped me with the corrections and the technical organisation of the volume in its early phases. Last but not least I thank Orla Mulholland the difficult task of correcting our written English.

## I Introduction

### I.1 Theoretical approaches to pilgrimages

Parallel with a revival of pilgrimages and processions in the Western world an enormous output on pilgrimage studies occurred between the 1960s and the 1980s, referring predominantly to non-Western countries. As Eade remarked, their theoretical focus concentrated either “on social structure and function” or with a “Marxist emphasis upon power, conflict and structural transformation.”<sup>1</sup>

Since the beginning of the 1990s feminist theories have also played their part.<sup>2</sup> In addition, the regional focus changed due to the hype over pilgrimage in Europe. Traditional pilgrimage centers in Spain,<sup>3</sup> Portugal,<sup>4</sup> and France<sup>5</sup> were analyzed in relation to the many changes induced by ever denser global relations. Prominent among them was and still is the route to Santiago de Compostela,<sup>6</sup> but also rather marginal pilgrimage sites in Sweden and in the Balkan states have been investigated.<sup>7</sup>

1 Eade 2013, x.

2 Dubisch 1995.

3 Crain 1997.

4 Scheer 2006.

5 Eade 2012.

6 Reuter and Graf 2014; Hervieu-Léger 2004; Stausberg 2010. Heiser and Kurat 2014, 8, report that in the past ten years more than 1.3 million people went by different paths to Santiago de Compostela.

7 Eade and Katić 2014.

The detailed consideration of new regions in pilgrimage studies has also led to a greater variety of theoretical approaches. While most of the earlier studies were written by authors from Anglophone countries, a recent book by Albera and Eade focuses on the contributions of scholars from non-English-speaking countries in order to demonstrate the richness of other scholarly traditions.<sup>8</sup> The book contains chapters of Japanese, Polish, Irish, French, Hungarian, Italian, and German-speaking histories of pilgrimage studies. For a German-speaking audience the chapter by Helmut Eberhart is of great interest.<sup>9</sup> He describes a long tradition of pilgrimage studies in German-speaking countries by folklore specialists, whereas German-speaking anthropologists have paid rather little attention to these movements.<sup>10</sup> The same situation existed in German sociology. According to Kurrat and Heiser sociologists discovered the topic only recently thanks to a new understanding of religion in times of global modernities.<sup>11</sup>

Despite the new theoretical framings and new insights that recent pilgrimage studies have offered, the path-breaking work of Edith and Victor Turner is still discussed, which underlines its outstanding quality. In *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture* Edith and Victor Turner described pilgrimages as a trajectory from the secular to the spiritual world and back.<sup>12</sup> Innovative in their analysis was a performative approach which they translated into social dialectics. The empowering potential of this theory was grounded in a utopian model which they turned into a condition of social change itself. Although the fascination with utopian models was in a way congruent with the revolutionary ambitions of the time, the explosive force in this construction was not social struggle but, according to the Turners, the transformation of an inner self through the confrontation with transcendent powers, be they God, the Virgin Mary, or the spirits of the mountains. It is a process of transformation which detaches the pilgrim from the local world of social structure and enables him to experience a state of *liminality*.<sup>13</sup>

For the Turners this situation was of special interest because of its potential for overcoming order. What fascinated them was the encounter with “comradeship and communion or *communitas*”<sup>14</sup> *Communitas* marks a phase of creative disorder, of spontaneity and inventions, where play and faith meet, where joy reigns as well as solemnity, devotion, and worship.<sup>15</sup> The experience of the journey, which is undertaken out of free will, the closeness to and identification with (whatever) transcendental beings, transforms the inner self of the pilgrim.<sup>16</sup> In Muslim societies it also leads to a higher

8 Albera and Eade 2015.

9 Eberhart 2015.

10 For an exception see Girtler 2005.

11 Heiser and Kurrat 2014, 12.

12 V. Turner and E. Turner 1978.

13 The term “liminality” is derived from Latin *limen* “threshold.” V. Turner and E. Turner 1978, 250, characterized liminality “as undifferentiated, equal-

tarian, direct, extant, nonrational, existential, I-Thou (in Buber’s sense).”

14 V. Turner and E. Turner 1978, 249.

15 See also: V. Turner 1969; V. Turner 1989.

16 See the moving account of the Black Panther Malcolm X, who described in his autobiography that during his pilgrimage to Mecca he could accept even white Muslims as equals and brothers, against

social status.<sup>17</sup> The experience of *communitas* is therefore in no way limited to individual transformations, but also has social repercussions as well. According to the dialectics of the movement *spontaneous communitas* passes over into *normative communitas*, which is stripped of its spontaneity and gives way to routinization or even bureaucratization.<sup>18</sup> This boldness of construction assigns to pilgrimages a highly transformative potential for the individual, but at the same time has socially integrative functions.

## 1.2 Challenging Turner

Despite their increasing datedness and the serious criticism, they have engendered, the Turners' ideas are still widely discussed.<sup>19</sup> The bulk of recent criticism of their pilgrimage analysis has been directed toward the existence of *communitas* as being a prime characteristic of pilgrimages. Many authors have criticized its assumption of equality and brotherhood and have stressed that hierarchy, regarding e.g. class structures, ethnicity, or kin relations, continue to exist or are even reaffirmed through pilgrimages.<sup>20</sup> Especially in Andean anthropology the existence of *communitas* has been denied as Sallnow, Skar, and also Schäfer have maintained that pilgrimages are organized according to the social structures of the villages and include the existence of conflicts between them, which in some situations are also openly played out.<sup>21</sup> Eickelman and Huber even sharpened this argument by suggesting that pilgrimages are focal points for conflicts and social division and that they function to preserve social hierarchies instead of minimizing them.<sup>22</sup> In these tit for tat arguments Skar offered a more differentiated solution.<sup>23</sup> He argued that in many pilgrimages some kind of pendulum exists between companionship and aggressiveness, equality and hierarchy, which reminded him of Bateson's term *schismogenesis*, which contains complementary forms of differentiation. This solution refutes the universal applicability of Turner's model but leaves more room for understanding the complexity of pilgrimages under diverse social and historical conditions.<sup>24</sup>

Although the Turners were aware that the increase and popularity of pilgrimages were part of modernity, their model, which classified pilgrimages in four categories – primordial, archaic, medieval, and modern – was too abstract to capture the great diversity that pilgrimages have exhibited. Bowman attributed these shortcomings of Turner's

whom he had had many racial prejudices before, here cited according to V. Turner 1974, 168. Further examples of such forms of *communitas* in Ross 2011 [1978], xxix–lvii.

17 A very well-known example is the very respectful title Hadji for a pilgrim returning from Mecca.

18 Turner himself regarded *communitas* as a very exceptional situation. In his later texts he compared it with situations in industrial societies where he

located an ideological *communitas* (V. Turner 1969).

19 Huber 1999, Skar 1985, and Schäfer, this volume.

20 Huber 1999, 8; Luthle-Hardenberg 2011, 45; Morinis 1984, 258.

21 Sallnow 1987, Skar 1985, and Schäfer, this volume.

22 Eickelman 1976; Huber 1999, 8.

23 Skar 1985.

24 See also Berg 1991, 342–343.

theory to the fact that “his model was dangerously divorced from political and cultural processes which heavily influenced the organization and the course of pilgrimages.”<sup>25</sup> Taylor shares this critique and adds that in contrast to Turner’s assumption that pilgrimages exist in liminal spaces,<sup>26</sup> being in and out of time, they represent in reality the very center of modern urban society.<sup>27</sup> “Most contemporary pilgrimage sites are anything but liminal; instead, they address the economic, social and cultural concerns of the places from which pilgrims are drawn.”<sup>28</sup> Although their destinations are very often situated in liminal places, on borders, mountaintops, or in caves, “they serve as nodes or cogs for the transfer of ideas and practices between centers of population and from centers to hinterlands.”<sup>29</sup> Pilgrimage sites thus express a multitude of meanings for different groups of people, which reflects their creative but also contradictory flows of ideas and representations.<sup>30</sup>

## 2 The volume

### 2.1 An empirical overview

The intention of this volume is a comparative analysis of past and present pilgrimages. The interdisciplinary composition of the authors raised stimulating questions of methodology which have allowed us to take a fresh look. Whereas anthropologists can rely on interviews and/or participant observations, historians and archaeologists have to tap new sources and resources, such as text fragments (Messner, Triplett), ceramics, images, sounds (Kubatzki), or architecture (Hammerschmied). In contrast to the much publicized failure of the conference in London in 1998 between historians and anthropologists the interdisciplinarity of our group gave rise to interesting discussions and enriched our disciplinary horizons.<sup>31</sup>

25 Bowman 1985, 3.

26 Taylor 2004, 16.

27 Soheila Shahshahani’s publication *Cities of pilgrimage* is a good example of this assumption (Shahshahani 2009).

28 Taylor 2004, 16.

29 Taylor 2004, 15.

30 Eade 2013, xiii, therefore proposes “to deconstruct the very category of pilgrimage”, since one can no longer be sure that the meaning of pilgrimage is shared by its participants. The conclusion he draws from this insight is that “the thrust of our analytic endeavour should be not towards the formulation of ever more inclusive, and consequently ever more vacuous, generalizations but instead towards the

examination of the specific peculiarities of its construction in each instance”. It is this insight, coupled with another result of Coleman and Elsner’s 1995 intervention that was seminal for the organization of the present volume (Coleman and Elsner 1995). Coleman and Elsner 1995, 202, wrote in a critical reflection on Eade and Sallnow’s work: “In other words, the emphasis on the idea of pilgrimage sites being void of intrinsic meaning does tend to ignore the considerable structural similarities in pilgrimage practices within and between traditions. There are indeed parallels in behaviour to be found across time and culture, even if the implications and meanings of such behaviour vary enormously.”

31 Eade 2013, ix; Bowman 1988.

Given the rapid transformation pilgrimage has undergone through technological innovations and changed religious and social needs, it seems necessary 1) to preserve our knowledge of older organizations of pilgrimages, and 2) to gain comprehensive insight into past pilgrimage practices in order to analyze their differences and understand eventual similarities. Consequently, a spectrum of dense empirical case studies in a historical and interdisciplinary perspective is offered. Starting from ancient Greece the trajectory leads through sixteenth- and seventeenth-century pilgrimages in China and Japan up to the present, which is represented by studies of pilgrimages in Bhutan, Madagascar, Peru, Morocco, and Germany.

The historical perspective is conceived on the one hand as a longitudinal study of pilgrimages under specific constellations of time, of power relations, and of social relationships. Unlike Coleman and Elsner's book on historical pilgrimages it does not concentrate on world religions, but rather focuses on regional and transnational religious sites – except in the cases of Japan and China. On the other hand, the past is traced inside particular pilgrimage traditions. One of the determining criteria for selection was that pilgrimages not be viewed as static but be analyzed as a dynamic process in which religious beliefs, political power structures, and economic endeavours are deeply intertwined and are the objects of change.

In contrast to earlier studies in the tradition of the Turners' approach the focus of this volume is not so much on the individual or social experience of pilgrimages but more on their organizational structure in their national or transnational surroundings. Although the extent of 'person to place centered' (Schrempf, Berriane this volume) and 'text centered' (Triplett, Messner this volume) sacredness<sup>32</sup> is represented in our case studies, the transformation of space into sacred places through ritual performances, objects, and the behavior of pilgrims is of foremost interest. How are these places constructed, and what kind of personal histories of saints, myths, and narratives are embedded in them? Why and under which circumstances did they become sacred, and what does 'sacred' mean in an intercultural context? What role do texts play in attributing sacredness, and what do we learn about the change of ritual practices under different power structures?

Sacred landscapes are understood and interpreted as landscapes of imagination, offering insight into the modalities of place-making through ritual performances. In establishing such sacred topographies questions of identity in relation to state power become important in many studies.<sup>33</sup> They also bring up the thorny question of the difference between procession and pilgrimage. There exist numerous definitions of these, and theoretical discord about the two terms among disciplines is widespread.<sup>34</sup> Etymol-

32 Eade and Sallnow 2013, 8.

33 Hammerschmied, Kneitz, Schrempf, Luthle-Hardenberg, and Schäfer this volume.

34 Gutschow 2008, 399; Jones 2007, 119; Werbeck, Galling, and Campenhausen 1961, 668–669.

ogy is helpful here. According to Grimm's dictionary the term 'procession' originates from the Latin word *processio*, which meant in the sixteenth and seventeenth century, "ein feierlicher, besonders kirchlicher aufzug, bittgang, umgang."<sup>35</sup> The term 'pilgrim' originates in the Latin word *peregrinus*, which means stranger or foreigner.<sup>36</sup> The term described a wanderer to a faraway sacred place but was also used without religious connotations, meaning just wandering about. The opposition between distance and familiarity of space is thus already present in the original meaning of the two terms, and these turn out to be an important criterion of differentiation in the following case studies.

Gutschow differentiates between linear and circular processions.<sup>37</sup> They are undertaken inside a limited area, such as a field, a (quarter of a) town, along a river, or to a mountainside where springs are found. They take place in local surroundings, without crossing unknown territory. Their organization is most of the time under the control of the local administration and is often disliked by the official clerics because of the secular festivities which follow the religious parts of the ceremonies.

Processions embody the veneration of the gods, which is marked by the presentation of sacred objects which are shown during the procession to the wider public. Besides expressing veneration and gratitude processions are also performed to ask for the well-being of the people and their animals as well as for good harvests. In general, they symbolize collective aims, such as the perpetuation of the relationship between the gods and the humans, or the continuation of historical traditions and local identities. Their celebration is set for a particular time and mostly follows a monthly or annual routine; others are held more irregularly, depending on the constellation of stars or different calendar practices.

In contrast pilgrimages are defined by longer journeys, traversing national boundaries, parts of deserts and wilderness, or high mountain slopes. These journeys lead into strange territories which demand detailed organization and challenge the endurance of the pilgrims. Their experience is correlated with bodily suffering and hardship, or with the acquaintance of power and knowledge, as Messner describes for China.<sup>38</sup> In their organization pilgrimages are free from direct political or ecclesiastical control, although regarded as potentially subversive by the official clerics. However, as some of the examples in this volume demonstrate social control is practiced by local organizers of collective pilgrimages.<sup>39</sup>

35 J. Grimm and W. Grimm 1889a, 2157. This reads in a free translation: "procession... is a ceremonial, especially religious parade or *rogation procession*."

36 J. Grimm and W. Grimm 1889a, 1848.

37 Gutschow 2008, 400.

38 Lienau 2014; Luthle-Hardenberg, this volume.

39 Schäfer, this volume; Luthle-Hardenberg, this volume. Jones' descriptions of pilgrimages contradict

this characterization, however. He differentiates between informal (Jones 2007, 125) and formal pilgrimages (Jones 2007, 120). Informal pilgrimages are directed to local places of power in the landscape which are not consecrated, whereas formal pilgrimages have a greater extension. In contrast to the above argument Jones describes informal pilgrimages as being under less control than the formal ones.

Besides distance and spatial intimacy, the motivation of participants is another difference between processions and pilgrimages, although one that is less clear cut. According to many authors pilgrimages are undertaken for very individual reasons:<sup>40</sup> to overcome a personal crisis, transcend a new stage in life (*rites de passage*), find a new kind of inner balance, to fulfil a religious obligation as in Islam, or to thank the gods for help, be it in relation to health, job security, or other personal problems. Kurrat classifies these motivations into five categories: 1) to draw up a biographical balance sheet, 2) handle a biographical crisis, 3) take biographical time out, 4) live through a status transition, or 5) start a new life.<sup>41</sup> He correlates these motivations with the expectations pilgrims have towards their co-pilgrims and gets interesting results. Those pilgrims who belong to category 1 are hardly interested in communication with their fellow pilgrims. They talk rather to God when evaluating their life. Pilgrims belonging to category 2 and 5 on the contrary hope very much for discussions and proposals to solve their problems, whereas those in category 3 and 4 expect security and advice.<sup>42</sup> I have quoted these research results at length because they allow a differentiated analysis of what *communitas* means for different categories of pilgrims. According to their biographical situations *communitas* has different dimensions or is even not wanted for their experience as pilgrims. It thus becomes clear again that Turner's structural exposition of *communitas* was far too generalized to comprehend individual situations. Kurrat's research results also prove that the transformation of the present or status quo into the future is one main motive for pilgrims, who show a strong will for change.

Despite these differences the motivations of participants in processions and pilgrims can and do overlap. Gratitude, repentance, and asking for help are widespread among participants in processions, not to forget the desire for social interaction. The organization of a communal ritual calendar plays a role as well. Axel Schäfer (this volume) convincingly demonstrates that processions and pilgrimages constitute a unified sacred event when the ritual season stretches over a longer time. Yet, forms of organization and control differ in regard to local or regional hierarchies. I will therefore argue that processions can either be performed singularly, i.e. they stand for themselves, or are part of a wider pilgrimage structure, as Luithle-Hardenberg describes for the Jain and Hammer-schmied and Kubatzki for Greece. Despite the differences that exist in regard to space, time, and scale in the organization of procession and pilgrimage, it seems impossible to formulate a universally applicable differentiation because of the many changes and dynamics that processions and pilgrimages undergo.

New landscapes of imagination are created in the diaspora in which new traditions of pilgrimage emerge. They allow fascinating insights into how far transnational net-

40 See the articles in Heiser and Kurrat 2014.

42 Kurrat 2014, 179.

41 Kurrat 2014.

works influence structures of religious belief and into the ways in which diasporas appropriate new urban spaces for religious practices.<sup>43</sup> The immediate gain of such a wide comparative time span is obvious. It respects the cultural and social conditions of each pilgrimage site and ties in with the hypothesis that despite the many changes pilgrimages have undergone their main structure and key orientations have remained stable.

## 2.2 A theoretical overview: From spaces to sacred places

The internal dynamics of pilgrimage sites demand a closer theoretical inspection of spaces and their transformation into sacred places. Discussions of space and place are intimately linked with the spatial turn which originated around the 1980s. Categories of space had been neglected by the social sciences since the rise of sociological theory at the beginning of the twentieth century.<sup>44</sup> Durkheim and Simmel had prioritized social over physical relationships, with the consequence that the analysis of space was left to the natural sciences in the following decades.<sup>45</sup> The abuse of space through Nazi politics (*Volk ohne Raum*), and later on the challenges of postcolonialism and geopolitics led to a basic change of paradigm in social geography.<sup>46</sup> The new approach was based on the insight that space was not considered as naturally given or as an ‘empty container’ but as having been constituted through human interactions, based on a creative interplay of movements, ideas, objects, and symbolic meanings.<sup>47</sup> This relational understanding of space, which was conceived as part of social practice, opened new research perspectives also for the discussion of pilgrimages.<sup>48</sup> The inscription of movements, ideas, objects, and symbolic meanings led deep into what Schlögel calls the materiality of space.<sup>49</sup> For him as a historian this included the search for traces of time and history that give spaces their particular singularity and transform them into places with identities of their own. Objects, too, play an important role in this process, as is shown in some case studies in this volume (Schrempf, Schäfer, Luchesi, Hammerschmied).<sup>50</sup>

In contrast to this constructionist conceptualization of space Maurice Merleau-Ponty stressed humans’ “being in the world”<sup>51</sup> as a form of emplacement but less through active interaction than by emphasizing “the essence of human existence as being emplaced.”<sup>52</sup> This notion of place, which underlines feelings of home and belonging, is insofar open to critique as it understands place as an innate category of human beings and not as contexts of interaction.<sup>53</sup> But “it is social interaction that turns them into

43 See also Werbner 1996.

44 Haller 2009.

45 Durkheim 1976; Simmel 2013 [1903].

46 Bachmann-Medick 2006; Schlögel 2007; Soja 1989.

47 Dünne 2013, 289.

48 Lefebvre 1991. See also: Löw 2001.

49 Schlögel 2007, 60.

50 For a more theoretical discussion see Kohl 2003.

51 Merleau-Ponty 1962.

52 Desplat 2012, 19.

53 Giddens 1992, 39.

cultural sites,” declare Olwig and Hastrup,<sup>54</sup> and into sacred places, one hastens to add. While there is wide agreement in the literature about the many strategies to be applied in order to achieve this transformation – through rituals including praying, singing, and offering sacrifices, but also through different kinds of movement such as circumambulation or prostration – the notion of what holy or sacred means in an intercultural context is open to interpretation.

### 2.3 Deconstructing the sacred

In many texts the word ‘sacred’ is still used as a kind of universal, referring to Durkheim’s ground breaking text on the elementary forms of religion.<sup>55</sup> For Durkheim the separation of the sacred from the profane was an essential part of all religions, a generalization that was rejected on empirical grounds by most British social anthropologists, among them Goody and Evans-Pritchard.<sup>56</sup> Evans-Pritchard continued a long-standing debate which, according to Evans, can be summarized into two theoretical strands.<sup>57</sup> On the one hand there is a substantivistic understanding of the sacred as a “transcendent reality,” on the other a situational-constructive approach which relates it to human agency.<sup>58</sup> Otto as a representative of the substantivistic approach described sacredness as a fundamental category of religious experience which could not be adequately expressed through language or through morality or rationality. For him the experience of sacredness was in itself ambiguous, since it contained opposite feelings, such as the *mysterium fascinans* on the one hand and on the other a mixture of fear (in the sense of cringing), terror, and awe which he called the *mysterium tremendum*.<sup>59</sup> The constructivist approach refers back to Lévi-Strauss, “who proposed that the sacred is open to the reception of any meaning.”<sup>60</sup> Like the debates about space this argumentation opened the floor to attributing sacredness to human agency and action instead of an essentialist understanding. The most prominent and radical representatives of this approach in the realm of pilgrimage studies are Eade and Sallnow. They refer in their introduction to the many, often controversial meanings the term bears for different groups, such as official clerics, shrine custodians, and pilgrims, not to mention the different interpretations among the pilgrims themselves of the place they visit.<sup>61</sup> The sacred means for Eade and Sallnow a “religious void, a ritual space, capable of accommodating diverse meanings and practices.”<sup>62</sup> And, contrary to substantivistic arguments which reiterate the sacred qualities of particular places as naturally given, Eade and Sallnow underline that it is

54 Olwig and Hastrup 1997, 26.

55 Durkheim 1976.

56 Goody 1961; Evans-Pritchard 1969.

57 Evans 2003.

58 Desplat 2012, 24.

59 Otto 1991, 42–43.

60 Quoted in Desplat 2012, 24.

61 See e.g. Crain 1997; Bowman 2013.

62 Eade and Sallnow 2013, 15.

the very quality of absorbing the plurality of discourses that “confers upon a shrine its essential, universalistic character.”<sup>63</sup>

The case studies in this volume facilitate an approach to the diverse meanings the term ‘sacred’ bears in different societies. In the Greek language no direct equivalent exists for the word ‘sacred’ since the words *hierós*, *bósios*, and *hágios* have different connotations. *Tà hierá* denotes sanctuaries, sacrifices, or rites. *Hósios* relates to the norms of God, but can also be applied to objects that are no longer holy, while *hágios* stresses what is forbidden. *Témenos*, translated as “holy district”, originates in the verb *témnein* which means to cut or to separate. Consequently, *témenos* is often characterized by *horoi* (boundary stones) or by *períboloi* (walls). The Latin word *sanctus* stood for persons, places, and objects which were thought of as inviolable and whose protection was guaranteed by the community. The adjective *sanctus* originates from *sancire*, which is translated as “to sanctify” or to make invulnerable by dedication. Already in ancient times *sacer* “denoted a place set apart as *sanctum*, usually a temple,”<sup>64</sup> while its surroundings symbolized the mundane, or the *profanus*, which originally meant being situated before the sanctified district (*fanum*).<sup>65</sup>

The association of the sacred with setting apart is also present in the Arabic root *q-d-s* (as in *qudsi* or *muqaddas*). A second sense of the sacred in Arabic is represented by the word *haram*, which can be translated as “l’interdit ou l’illicite”, a correlation which is also found in other religions.<sup>66</sup> For example, in Oceania the word *tabu* or *tapu* is associated with something that is forbidden, e.g. a powerful sacred object that should not be touched.<sup>67</sup> In sharp contrast to the above examples the term ‘sacred’ in China refers to knowledge (composed of magic and medicine) and wisdom which are located in the mountains. It is conceptualized as a counter world which is symbolized through “longevity and immortality.”<sup>68</sup>

The digression into the intercultural variability of the term ‘sacred’ pursues a deconstructed understanding of the sacred in its relation to place or place making. The great variety of holy places underlines that these places are created by different social and religious practices and embody a vast range of emotional experiences. However, despite the many differences some similarities remain: ‘Sacred’ in its different meanings refers either to something forbidden or exceptional, be it in regard to everyday practices or to superior knowledge. It may engender different sets of emotions ranging from the empowering to fear or horror, but also those of protection and awe. These various constructions of the sacred allow for a wide variety of usages. It gives meanings to objects, persons, and buildings, turning spaces into places. Shrines of the dead, often founders

63 Eade and Sallnow 2013, 15.

64 Desplat 2012, 24.

65 Quoted after Werbeck, Galling, and Campenhausen 1959, 146.

66 Berriane 2014, 30.

67 Hirschberg 1988.

68 Messner, this volume.

of religions,<sup>69</sup> trees, e.g. the one where Buddha experienced enlightenment, or mountains are widespread examples of sacred places which are quite often combined with legends or myths, but also with temples or religious statues. They thus create a kind of sacred topography or sacred landscape of which several examples are discussed in this volume.<sup>70</sup>

### 3 The case studies

#### 3.1 Landscapes of imagination

Sacred landscapes are landscapes of imagination transformed through ritual encounters and past events as well as through the narration of myths and legends. Historical evidence which dates from prehistoric times onwards bears witness to such place-making, which reveals that sacred spaces are quite often part of territorially connected networks. In India, the Himalayas, and in Japan and China pilgrimage circuits constitute sacred topographies which are organized and numbered according to historical or religious events. Their sacredness is confirmed either by circumambulation of one temple or by undertaking the whole circuit described in the texts. If such sites were visited regularly, they developed a central sanctity, which had the potential to become a nodal point of regional, national, or international relations. Famous examples are found in all continents: Stonehenge, the Temple Mount in Jerusalem, Mecca, or Benares, to name just a few. Benares, writes Michaels, “condenses the abundance of the Hindi world and turns it into a paradigm for many other sacred spaces in India without being the center of them.”<sup>71</sup> One of them is the vast temple complex Shatrunjaya which consists of 108 temples and about 1000 smaller shrines. It is called *tirthadhiraja*, “the king of pilgrimage places.”<sup>72</sup> It is believed to have been founded by the 24 Jinnas, called *fordmakers* (*tirthankaras*), who are the founders of Jain religion. These ascetic saints and prophets are believed to have laid out “the ford, ‘*tirtha*’, across ‘the ocean of rebirths’ (*samskara*) to humankind before they attained spiritual salvation.”<sup>73</sup> Since the Jain, an Indian merchant caste, do not have a territory of their own, their identity and continuity as a group is dependent on these pilgrimages, which can unite up to 10 000 people. They consider the mountain Shatrunjaya to be “one of the few places of eternity within a vast and constantly changing universe.”<sup>74</sup>

69 See Berriane, this volume.

70 See articles by Messner, Triplett, Hammerschmied, Schäfer, Luithle-Hardenberg, Schrempf, this volume.

71 Gutschow and Michaels 1993, 12.

72 See Luithle-Hardenberg, this volume.

73 Luithle-Hardenberg, this volume.

74 Luithle-Hardenberg, this volume.

Equally impressive is the *Shikoku circuit*, described by Katja Triplett, which extends 1400 km and includes 88 pilgrimage sites on Shikoku Island. The pilgrimage is done on foot, although recently cars or buses have been used. The founder of the circuit, the monk Kukai (774–835) later known as Kobo Daishi, is referred to by the pilgrims as Daishi-Sama, Lord Great Teacher. The path which leads through all four provinces of Shikoku Island is partitioned into four stages which symbolize resolve, discipline, insight, and nirvana. The aim of the pilgrims is to gain merit for themselves which can also be transferred to others; the transfer of merit is especially valued, since it is seen as a precondition for the “insight into the basic emptiness of all phenomena.”<sup>75</sup>

The *Saikoku circuit*, which has existed since the fifteenth century,<sup>76</sup> is more complex and less rigidly organized than the Shikoku path. It presents an interesting contrast to the Shikoku path which, until the building of a bridge in 1986, was situated in a rather remote region that had the reputation of being mystical and poor, whereas the Saikoku path leads around the former imperial city of Kyoto. It touches 33 pilgrimage temples, most of them devoted to the bodhisattva Kannon, who is known outside Japan as Avalokiteshwara. This bodhisattva cares for the well-being of the people by liberating them from suffering, ignorance, and disease.

During the eighteenth century there was an unsuccessful attempt to connect the two pilgrimage paths into a unified form of sacred landscape by including 20 more temples, in order to reach the mystical number 108, which stands in Buddhist thought for luck.<sup>77</sup> Triplett refers to 100 temples and dates this fusion to the eighteenth century. Yet, each path defends its particular identity. In contrast to the remoter Shikoku paths the 33 circuits of the Saikoku have always included sites of both “serious asceticism” and worldly recreation, underlining fixed rules combined with individual creativity. It is this combination of spirituality and tourism, Triplett argues, that is responsible for the ongoing popularity of this pilgrimage circuit around the bustling town of Kyoto.

Angelika Messner points out that recreation and spirituality were also part of Chinese pilgrimages.<sup>78</sup> In China of the sixteenth and seventeenth century, mountains (*shan* 山) were the paragon of sacredness and were therefore preferred pilgrimage sites. Mountaintops were regarded as entrance to heaven and residence of the deities. Five prominent mountains formed a chain known as the five holy mountains (*wu yue* 五嶽), which were central for the national order. The fact that kings went to pray and made offerings there conferred a special aura on them, which was reflected in the analogy between the five mountains and the imperial city. However, beyond their symbolic meanings as places of magic as well as of *materia medica*, the mountains were also places of relaxation and

75 Triplett, this volume.

76 The practice of visiting 33 temples is already known from the twelfth century.

77 Gutschow 2008, 411.

78 See also Luithle-Hardenberg and Schrepf in this volume.

well-being. Messner quotes a rich pilgrim in the seventeenth century who reported in his travelogue that he saw in one of the inns more than twenty stables for horses, an equal number of rooms for theatrical performances, and separate rooms with prostitutes. He also mentioned that there were three categories of rooms which differed in price and in the amenities offered. After the successful climbing of the mountain lavish banquets with wine were offered in the evening.

Messner's article is a good example for Schlögel's claim that pilgrimage sites reveal the materiality of spaces and give insight into their history. It lays open the organization of the pilgrimages with agencies, hostels, and restaurants as well as a diversified class structure, which she delineates through the different social backgrounds of the pilgrims. The comparison of past and recent sacred landscapes created through pilgrimages thus reveals astonishing analogies. They are not only landscapes of imagination which refer to very different contents but also places of communication, of pleasure and well-being, of trade and money-making, as well as emblems of power.

### 3.2 Texts, images, architecture

A study of past pilgrimage experiences immediately poses the question of sources to which archaeologists, historians, and anthropologists have different access. The case studies in this volume offer interesting different approaches. The archaeologist Kristoph Hammerschmied can base his analysis on a wide range of excavation materials, which allow insight into the construction and orientation of temples. Furthermore, temple inscriptions and the remains of statues enable him to decipher their symbolic meanings. Determining for the interpretation are also the orientation and sequence of the buildings, and the epigraphic and pictorial evidence of temple friezes which facilitate reconstructions of the procession through extrapolation. Since ancient Greece was a literate society, texts also exist. Written by historians, they are compilations of myths and legends which describe the foundation of particular towns or sacred spaces. Prominent among these were the narratives about the Trojan War which can be seen as a crystallization point of a Panhellenic identity.

Jana Kubatzki, a musico-archeologist, draws attention to the role of musical instruments in greek processions and analyzes in depth the various paintings on walls and vases. Some of the earliest paintings are found on the Sarcophagus of Hagia Triada in Crete from Minoan times. These paintings, which exist on all four sides of the sarcophagus, can be read as a complex narrative referring to "life, death, sacrifice, homage, passage and regeneration."<sup>79</sup> The analysis of different styles through the centuries allows interesting insights into the development of processions, ranging from mere dances to

79 Walgate 2002, 1.

fully developed rituals. However, vase paintings are insofar problematic as it is not clear whether they depict concrete realities or may be poetical reflections rather than documentations of cults.

Written texts and wall paintings or hangings are also important sources for the reconstruction<sup>80</sup> of pilgrimages in the sixteenth and seventeenth century in Japan and China. In Japan different text genres exist that give instructions for pilgrimages. The most important of these texts is the Lotus Sutra, which prescribes rules and precise behavior during the pilgrimage.<sup>81</sup> It also contains details about the 33 manifestations of Kannon, the most revered bodhisattva in Japan, who is better known as Avalokiteshwara. Besides the sutra, itineraries and lists of temples and places are instrumental for the organization of the journey. Whereas the itineraries have remained unchanged since the sixteenth century, the lists which contain practical guidelines and knowledge of hostels along the way have undergone constant transformation. Another important source was the pilgrim's book, in which pilgrims painstakingly noted down which temples they had visited, the donations they gave, and the seal and calligraphy they received. These books are not souvenirs, according to Triplett, but the "material testimony of one's piety and dedication."<sup>82</sup>

The detailed scriptural report of one's pilgrimage documents the very close link between religious piety, memory, and historical traditions. These traditions are also documented by *foundation legends (engi)* which contain information about the history of specific temples and their deities. *Engi* consist of historical information, moralistic stories, fairy tales, and esoteric or philosophical reflections. *Miracle stories* refer to extraordinary deeds of the deities who supported the faithful in difficult situations. During the seventeenth century miracle stories were compiled into manuscripts which also contained prints and songs. Such texts are still popular to this day and are reproduced on the website of the temples or even in Manga stories. Their publication is not only valuable for historical reasons; it also indicates the contribution of religious texts to the expansion of Buddhism and its adaptation by a society with a high degree of literacy at the time.

Perhaps even more powerful than the diverse texts were the pilgrimage maps and other religious paintings. They depicted real temples and scenes of rituals combined with representations of deities and pilgrims, thus creating a symbolic scenery where natural and imaginative worlds were fused. They invited the viewer to participate in the world of Kannon and other deities as well as in the lives and histories of important monks from China and India who brought Buddhism to Japan.

80 In an interesting article Feldman argues that texts are not only used to reconstruct pilgrimages but actually to constitute them in relation to landscape and past histories (Feldman 2007).

81 The idea of a "textual pilgrimage" (Eade and Sallnow 2013, 8) which Bowman describes for Jerusalem, offers itself for comparison but would need a more detailed analysis.

82 Triplett, this volume.

The reconstruction of pilgrimages in China during the seventeenth century also depends predominantly on texts that were produced by literary intellectuals of the time. Since most pilgrims were illiterate, the content of these texts was quite different from the ones in Japan. They did not contain practical information for the pilgrims but reflected the different interests of the literati. Some were primarily interested in literacy and in the aesthetics of the countryside, while others went to the mountains to seek medical knowledge. Although texts do play a role in anthropological case studies as well in the form of archival sources, their main resources are interviews with pilgrims and all sorts of officials as well as direct participation. Documentation by photographs and films also plays an increasing part.

### 3.3 Approaching the sacred: Social organization, ritual, objects

Pilgrims' movement in space represents complex performances consisting of the worshippers, the spaces which they traverse, the rituals they undertake along the way, and finally the arrival at the sacred site.<sup>83</sup> On these journeys territorial, ritual, and intellectual experiences are made, which are synthesized into one performance. The complexity of these movements needs long-term planning, special ritual and material knowledge of objects, songs, texts, and myths, as well as knowledge of the territory to be traversed.

Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg describes painstakingly the elaborate and very costly preparations for Jain pilgrimages that are needed in order to lead hundreds or even thousands of persons through the desert to the temple complex of Shatrunjaya (see above, page 18). To organize a pilgrimage of such dimensions is an extreme challenge regarding organizational know-how, time, and finances. Many older well-to-do Jains have the wish to invest their earnings at the end of their lives for their spiritual salvation and arrange for a pilgrimage. They are supported by their wives and younger family members, who organize the erection of tent camps along the route; besides food and shelter, other provisions have to be bought and transported as well.

The aim of the journey bestows on it from the beginning something extraordinary, which is expressed in special dress of the travellers,<sup>84</sup> marking them as pilgrims. A specific walking order of the group reveals their social relationships in everyday life, but also marks their functions in the ceremonies on the way and at their final destination. The structure of Jain processions, for example, are manifestations of the fourfold community (of ascetics and lay people): musicians are followed by male lay pilgrims who dance in honor of the male and female ascetics who follow behind. A picture of their deceased leader Acarya is carried and displayed in the procession.

83 See Hammerschmied, Kubatzki, Schäfer, Luithle-Hardenberg, this volume.

84 See Triplett, Schäfer, Kubatzki, this volume.

In other processions Marian statues,<sup>85</sup> or local or national saints as in Peru,<sup>86</sup> are carried along. These sacred objects<sup>87</sup> form, besides the prayers, songs, and dance, the core of the processions.<sup>88</sup> They embody sacred powers which are thought to be transferred to the believers by touching them.<sup>89</sup> Touching a sacred object conveys intimacy with it and thus deepens the process of spiritual and bodily healing.<sup>90</sup>

Ritual performances are the culmination of processions and pilgrimages. They are either solemn or enthusiastic interplays of visual impressions and sensuous feelings including colors, odors, and sounds. Colorful garments mark the functions of the participants in the processions and merge with the smells of flowers and other decorations. Incense heightens the sensory experience together with the sounds of music, the ecstasy of dancers, or on the contrary the silence of meditation and prayer. It is the sensory richness of the rituals and performers that appropriates and transforms space into sacred places. The rituals also structure the spaces in between, mediating between the ordinary at the beginning and the triumph of the extraordinary at the destination of the pilgrimage.

In several pilgrimages the traversing of the wilderness as a space-in-between is important for its success. Wilderness, defined as uninhabited, uncultivated, but also threatening space, can have different physical appearances. In the case of the Jain pilgrimage the desert is conceived as wilderness which has to be passed with little or no water. Similar 'wild passages' had to be mastered in Japan along the Shikoku path which led across deep forests and rivers, while Schäfer describes the steepness of the Andean mountains up to 5000 feet and their extreme climatic conditions. The willingness to suffer and endure bodily hardship – such as walking on foot, prostration, dietary prohibitions, or increases in the load to be carried – seem to be a widespread universal of pilgrims' search for salvation and redemption.<sup>91</sup> These times of crisis may lead to the outbreak of conflicts<sup>92</sup> or foster strong social support among the group, as Luithle-Hardenberg describes for the Jains. Despite the temptation to consider the Jains' situation as *communitas*, the notion "brotherhood in pain"<sup>93</sup> seems to be more appropriate, since Jain pilgrimage confirms structure instead of negating structure.

85 Luchesi, this volume.

86 Schäfer, this volume.

87 A detailed report on sacred objects can be found in Coleman and Elsner 1995, 100–103, 108–112.

88 Recent research has given increased attention to the materiality of objects, including their symbolic as well as practical meaning. For further discussions see also Bynum 2011, Kohl 2003 and Kubatzki, this volume.

89 Schäfer, Luchesi personal communication, Shahshahani 2009, 15–16.

90 Geissler and Prince 2013, 11, analyze touch in new ways as a form of merging, and link it to cultures of relatedness.

91 Eade and Sallnow 1991 and Eade and Sallnow 2013 stress in their introduction the importance of the suffering body as a form of penitence and salvation while Dahlberg 2013 concentrates her analysis on the sick pilgrims and their search for healing.

92 Sallnow 1987, 7.

93 Oliver-Smith 1999.

Axel Schäfer's contribution to this volume describes the complexity of the ritual structure of pilgrimages in the Peruvian Andes. His research results show a ritual calendar of several months in which procession and pilgrimages were neatly intertwined. He argues against Turner's strict dichotomy of local cults (processions) being hierarchical and exclusive while pilgrimages are described as voluntary, equal, and inclusive. Besides, the conflicts between several groups of pilgrims regarding access to the mountain sanctuary which are ritually fought out refutes the idea of equality and inclusiveness among the pilgrims and also contradicts the hypothesis that pilgrimages and processions are separate events. Some of the pilgrims to the *Señor de Qoyllur Rit'i*, a local mountain deity responsible for the health and well-being of people and animals, also participate in the Christian festival of Corpus Christi in Cuzco, which is the most important festival in the region. Schäfer argues that the procession and the pilgrimage are closely interwoven as regards the participants, the time of performance, and the reverence for their local patron saints. He opposes the evaluation by Sallnow that Corpus Christi is a local festival, by addressing the origins of the participants, who come from different and distant communities. Sallnow's interpretation appears in fact as an attempt to "center religious practice on the Catholic functionaries and on the places and objects that they dominate"<sup>94</sup>, leaving the local populations aside.

### 3.4 Governments, identities, and the negotiation of meaning

The historical depth of the case studies in this volume enables the reader to situate pilgrimages in their social contexts under various political conditions. It soon becomes obvious that although pilgrimages are conceived as religious practice they have deep political effects and are affected at the same time by political power relations. Several case studies in this volume are concerned with their political dimension in addition to their social functions, which ranges from the construction of identity to the interference by central authorities (the polis) or the 'government'.

In the Middle Ages the emperor and the church were concerned about the well-being of Christian pilgrims. They decreed that pilgrims had to be given food and shelter by the monasteries or religious foundations, that they were freed from customs, and that criminal acts against them had to be severely punished by law. However, these privileges did not arise out of purely humanitarian considerations. The constant increase in pilgrims from the fourth century, but especially in the years of the plague, proved to be an important economic resource, on the one hand.<sup>95</sup> On the other, the acquisition of reliquaries by national or regional governments, which led to new pilgrimage centers,

94 Schäfer, this volume.

95 Coleman and Elsner 1995, 83–84.

contributed to the political power and social status of the rulers and the church.<sup>96</sup> Thus from the early beginnings of Christianity pilgrimages were intertwined with politics. At first the relation had all the characteristics of a gesture of support but later on, during the Inquisition, it exhibited forms of atonement.

Political ambitions over the control of pilgrimages were, however, not limited to Christianity but, as Kristoph Hammerschmied describes in his paper, were also part of the policy of the Greek polis. Due to the wish for representation the poleis organized pilgrimages on a transregional level. They fulfilled numerous functions. Besides the obligation to honor the gods, they were vehicles for status appraisal by the respective polis and an appropriate means to confirm their identity.<sup>97</sup> In order to publicize their festival, messengers were sent to every corner of the Greek world to invite participants in several days of worship, games, and lavish entertainment. These festivities demanded smooth organization and catering for several thousand people. They also included costly building measures, be they in the form of renovations or the construction of new temples. The sacred aura of these places enabled them to serve “as spatial markers of the sacral legitimization of political power” and in this capacity they became symbols of a Panhellenic identity.<sup>98</sup>

Hammerschmied’s article underlines that already in ancient Greek times pilgrimages were embedded in a dense web of religious, social, and political motives and therefore were used by governments for their own ends. Axel Schäfer’s article, however, is an interesting example of how such forms of political instrumentalization are resisted by the population, who impress their own meaning on them. His case study deals with the negotiation of meaning of the Corpus Christi procession and its leading saint, Santiago. After the defeat of the Inka kingdom Spanish administrators created the Corpus Christi procession as a direct celebration of their power and the repression and humiliation of the Inka population. Especially the Cathedral of Cuzco was turned into a synonym of subjugation. The colonial state conceptualized Corpus Christi as a triumph of the social order. The symbol of this official interpretation was the saint Santiago, who is depicted as a horse rider swinging a sword in his right hand. According to the Catholic colonial church he represented the successful battle against the Inka. The fact that this aggressive symbol of Spanish colonial power became one of the most prominent local saints seems at first rather surprising. However, the descendants of the Inka challenged the Spanish interpretation of Santiago as subjugator of the Inka by reversing the colonial interpretation. They celebrate Santiago as their own God, *yallapa*, the master of lightning and ruler of the universe. Schäfer’s analysis describes in great detail how carefully the procession during Corpus Christi orchestrates a revision of the official hierarchy of the saints

96 Coleman and Elsner 1995, 108–110.

97 See also: Kubatzki, this volume.

98 Hammerschmied, this volume.

by appropriating them as local. Many of these details remain hidden from the officials so that both sides are able to uphold their own interpretation. Schäfer's description thus confirms Eade and Sallnow's thesis of the ambiguity of pilgrimages, which may have an inbuilt potential for subversion.<sup>99</sup> It is this particular characteristic which explains why they are feared and sometimes even forbidden by politicians and religious institutions. His example also proves that pilgrimage sites are important icons of history, representing the embodied memory of a place or nation. They can also be read as a cultural archive in which their changing functions and organization are revealed.

The contribution of Peter Kneitz highlights this dimension. His analysis centers on the transformation of a once royal residence into a pilgrimage site (*doany*) in postcolonial Madagascar. Particularly striking in his analysis is that his description is a rare example of the development of a pilgrimage *in situ*.

The *doany* Miarinarivo is at present a famous meeting place for possession,

which allows the participants to worship ancestors of different historical epochs simultaneously and to establish thereby a particular way of communication, or, among others, [...] regional and ethnic identification, including the political.<sup>100</sup>

In contrast visits to the royal palace in the nineteenth century had predominantly political grounds, since the subjects came to pay tribute to the king as well as to the ancestors to confirm their loyalty. The main ritual, called *fanompoa*, which included the anointing of the relics of the ancestors, was predominantly considered a political act of loyalty and the acknowledgment of Sakalava identity. Things changed, however, with the arrival of French colonial power in 1896. The kings lost their active political influence, although the structures of the kingdom remained intact. The dynamic of the political process in postcolonial Madagascar led to more than 50 *doany* – meaning royal residence and shrine at the same time – and the foundation of several sub-shrines, that is secondary *doanys*. Not surprisingly, the different shrines which together formed a sacred landscape developed along different trajectories. While some gradually lost their religious attraction, others, such as the *doany* of Miarinarivo, became prominent centers that turned into national and international foci of pilgrimage and tourism. The several case studies in this chapter not only represent the rich diversity of pilgrimage sites but also display the direct link between political power and sacred places. Sacred places and their sanctuaries have a strong dynamic of their own which may either allow for their liberation from state control, as in Madagascar and to a certain extent in Cuzco, exhibiting a subversive potential, or else they may submit to state orchestration, as in ancient Greece.

99 Eade and Sallnow 2013, 10–14.

100 Kneitz, this volume.

### 3.5 Sanctuaries and tourism: Pilgrimage sites in a globalized world

Pilgrimages and processions have undergone a kind of revival in recent decades in the Western world despite or because of the fundamental transformations by modernity. The reasons for this intensified interest are numerous. Although official religious membership is decreasing in many European countries, spirituality on a non-organized level has increased for several years.<sup>101</sup> Compared with earlier pilgrimages there are numerous alleviations which make pilgrimages accessible to a wider public. At present most places of worship can be reached by plane, truck, car, or bicycle, while the classic tradition of walking on foot is on the decrease.<sup>102</sup> Besides, many pilgrims no longer organize their route themselves, but rely on commercial offers either by monasteries or by religious or commercial travel agencies to organize and facilitate their journey. The many advertisements found in travel agencies that market holy places all over the world create a ritually structured landscape on a worldwide scale.<sup>103</sup> This kind of religious topography is no longer only physically explored but can easily be substituted by visual pilgrimages, saving time, effort, and money.<sup>104</sup>

Although the motives for pilgrimages had never been exclusively religiously oriented, as the case studies in this volume prove, under the conditions of globalization the difference between pilgrims and tourists has narrowed. With their combined attractions of religious experience, social interactions, and spiritual and physical adventures pilgrimages fulfil some fundamental aspirations of modern life. In a globalized world where time and space are condensed, they promise modes of *Entschleunigung*,<sup>105</sup> a term which is difficult to translate. It implies more than just to slow down, since the promise of tranquillity and the chance to encounter one's inner self go with it. It is for this reason that some authors identify 'the pilgrim' as an emblematic figure of the contemporary world.<sup>106</sup> Discussing Baumann's ideas of "liquid modernities" or Clifford's older version of a world "en route" makes the many facets of movements a dominating topos of (post)modernity.<sup>107</sup> However movements in a globalized world are not only voluntary but are imposed on millions of people because of social and political conditions. Failed states, internal wars, natural disasters with resulting food shortages, poverty, and a steady increase in global inequality has led to waves and waves of migration and the foundation of diasporas. One of the results of these movements is that Western cities

101 Berger 1992.

102 See articles by Luthle-Hardenberg, Triplett and Schäfer in this volume.

103 E.g. <http://www.pilger-buero.de/> (visited on 20/07/2017), Diözese Freiburg. However, churches and abbeys supported and facilitated pilgrimages already in the Middle Ages (Coleman and Elsner 1995, 110). Characteristic for modernity is not the

engagement of religious institutions but their kind of marketing.

104 Hill-Smith 2009. See also Ross 2011 [1978], xlvii–xlviii, for further consequences of digitization on religion.

105 Rosa 2013.

106 Coleman and Eade 2004, 5.

107 Baumann 2000; Clifford 1997.

have undergone a “conquest of space,” as Pnina Werbner framed it, since migrants have erected mosques, temples, or churches in their countries of arrival, which are imbued with new moral and cultural orders.<sup>108</sup>

Brigitte Luchesi describes in detail the efforts Tamil immigrants have undertaken in Germany since the 1980s when they arrived in great numbers due to the civil war in Sri Lanka. But in contrast to many immigrant groups who at first have to use buildings in industrial settings for their worship,<sup>109</sup> Tamil Hindu migrants in Germany were soon able either to erect their own temples or to use Christian churches for their services, if Catholic. A very special act of ‘sacralizing conquest’ is the Tamil pilgrimage to the Catholic Marian shrine in Kevelaer, which represents after Altötting the second largest pilgrimage site in Germany. Kevelaer is renowned for its copperplate print depicting the Mother of Christ as Our Lady of Luxembourg, which dates from 1623. By coincidence, a small group of Tamil Catholics were invited by their parish in Essen to participate in the pilgrimage to Kevelaer. Being intrigued by the similarity of the Kevelaer Madonna with their own Madonna in Sri Lanka, they adopted the former as their own. A constant increase in pilgrims was the consequence, reaching from 50 in 1987 to 15 000 in 2002. The interesting point is that not only Catholics but also Tamil Hindu families have adopted the Kevelaer Madonna, although by slightly changing her meaning since she is not interpreted as the mother of Jesus, but as the wife of some Hindu gods. Important for all Tamils is her power to bring peace. Luchesi insists that the worship of the same goddess by representatives of different religions is quite usual in India and is not an outcome of their diaspora situation in Germany. What is typical however for pilgrimages in a global context is that the same sanctuary engenders different meanings, which enforce a constant process of negotiation. While the first generation of immigrants experience the Kevelaer pilgrimages as a kind of spiritual empowerment that symbolizes their integration into German society, for their children – it seems – socializing and shopping for East Asian food and other goods in the market in front of the cathedral is more rewarding. The current trend that pilgrimages tend to change more and more into touristic endeavors, although their religious concern is still upheld, has been observed and described for other pilgrim groups as well.<sup>110</sup> The present popular pilgrimages on the road to Santiago as well as to El Rocio in Andalusia, or to Fatima in Portugal are cases in point.<sup>111</sup>

Very similar forms of movements are also discussed in Johara Berriane’s paper, which analyzes the pilgrimages of Senegalese followers of the Tidjaniyya, a Sufi cult, to the shrine (*zawiya*) of their founder in Fez. From the very beginning the cult was

108 Werbner 1996, 309. – For further examples see Eade 2009.

109 See Adogame 2010.

110 For a summary of this literature see the introduction by Eade 2013.

111 Crain 1997.

embedded in transnational networks, because after the death of the founder Ahmad al-Tidjani in Fez his sons and disciples spread his teachings in West Africa. Due to the mass migration of many Senegalese to France and other parts of Europe the Tidjani network also spread to Europe. Many Tidjani followers, including women, dream of a pilgrimage to Fez. Being close to their saint Ahmad al-Tidjani is seen as a source of empowerment since a strong belief exists that he fulfils one's wishes. His followers also combine the journey with economic opportunities and if possible with a visit to Mecca as well. Conditions for such a journey were facilitated by the fact that an old established trade route existed between Senegal and Morocco whose importance increased when air fares became cheap and affordable. The increasing role of the *zawiya* in Fez was instrumentalized by the Moroccan state for its own political aims to mediate between the two countries and West Africa in general but also by the tourist agencies in Fez. The latter were quick to offer extended visits to other Moroccan religious sites in order to promote tourism in their country. The close relation between tourism and pilgrimages opens new markets which generate new sacred topographies. They are no longer focused only on historic sites related to the Tidjaniyya but include the mausoleum of Mohammed V as well. In this way new itineraries are created which celebrate active and lived Islam, transcending ethnic as well as national boundaries.

Mona Schrepf's article also comprises detailed information about the interplay between the state, monastic authorities, and tourist agencies regarding the transformation of a popular pilgrimage site and festival in eastern Bhutan. She gives a detailed account of how local and national bureaucracies and the Buddhist clergy appropriated both the sacred place and the ritual structure of the festival, which used also to be an important trading market among the many different ethnic groups in this borderland area with India. In colorful pictures Schrepf narrates the development and different aspects of a local popular pilgrimage festival into the Gomphu Kora Tsechu, a recently established state monastic dance performance and procession in honor of the great Tantric master Guru Rinpoche, who in the eighth century left his magical traces here. Many thousands of pilgrims circumambulate his 'paradise' rock at the time of the festival and visit his nearby meditation cave in order to participate in the various powers of Guru Rinpoche that are embodied in this landscape. They circumambulate, recite prayers, and ingest substances for fertility, a long life, and a better rebirth.

The festival of Gomphu Kora has long been an important event in this border region, since it combined local trade with social encounters of different ethnic and linguistic groups in this easternmost part of Bhutan, including their neighbors from India. The popular festival celebrated the diversity of life. Pilgrims and locals were engaged in local folk dances and songs, sexual encounters and intermarriages, and the exchange of local products as well as in prayers and circumambulations for a better rebirth. How-

ever, Buddhist representatives of the Drukpa Kagyu order of Vajrayana Buddhism – the state religion of Bhutan – as well as the local and national government transformed this local sanctuary and festival into one of the main tourist attractions in this otherwise impoverished and remote area. In order to counter outmigration and subsistence farming, a state tourism plan instigated economic development in this area by newly establishing and organizing well-known state performances by the Drukpa Kagyu clergy, which are regularly performed elsewhere in the country as a heavily promoted routine tourist attraction. These ritual masked dances in honor of Guru Rinpoche, called *tsechu*, are the trademark of Bhutan’s ‘traditional culture’ for tourist display. To the Gomphu Kora Tsechu, a new *tanka* display and ritual procession were added, perfectly and professionally represented to a growing international audience. Through various measures the rich and diverse religious folk festival of earlier times was replaced by an officially and state orchestrated cultural event. As a result Schrempf concludes:

The new standardized performance seems to have extinguished a rich diversity of folk dances and songs, languages, and customs which has turned formerly active multi-ethnic and multi-lingual agents into more passive audiences and consumers of a state religious display.<sup>112</sup>

Commercialization, tourism, and state interests went hand in hand to transform a very potent religious site and festival into one of standardized cultural heritage in which the richness of local traditions has become streamlined into a festival which is still presented as an important religious event but exhibits all the signs of a tourist spectacle.

#### 4 Conclusion

The articles in this volume underline the dynamic nature of pilgrimage, which has characterized its existence right from its beginning. Being embedded in and part of different religious, socioeconomic, and political structures, pilgrimages have changed their meanings and adapted their forms over time according to changes in society, but they still do embrace “tradition and change,” as Ross has aptly remarked.<sup>113</sup> The constant flow of ideas, practices, and knowledge which is part of the globalized world as well as the many technological innovations discussed above have rather enriched than weakened this practice. In general, the social composition of pilgrims has broadened, as have their motives for undertaking the journey. Although most motives to undertake a pilgrimage have existed for centuries – such as seeking health, fertility, wisdom, gratitude

112 Schrempf, this volume.

113 Ross 2011 [1978], xlii.

for support in a crisis situation, trade, or social entertainment – new ones have come into play. To ask for wealth or a good job, to meet relatives and friends, to enhance one's social status, or to find inner harmony are powerful reasons which mix with older ones. It is this malleability that enables an institution such as pilgrimage to contain different and contradictory meanings and cope with fundamental changes in religious practices. The transformation “from a culture of obligation to a culture of consumption”<sup>114</sup> which stresses the free decisions of individuals to undertake pilgrimages out of pleasure instead of obligation has broadened the field of how to construct pilgrimages in (post)modernity. The very popularity that pilgrimages enjoy in present-day Europe is the result of these transformations which, however, seem to pose new questions regarding secular and religious pilgrims as well as the role of states. Yet, these questions are not altogether new, since Turner and Turner remarked that “a tourist is half a pilgrim if a pilgrim is half a tourist.”<sup>115</sup> And Coleman and Elsner discuss in their work the interference already of the medieval state in the commercialization of pilgrimages and sacred sites. What is new in (post)modernity, however, is a change in balance between the religious and the secular, with the latter – sometimes via the process of hybridization – gaining more importance.<sup>116</sup> Although the long-term perspective of our analysis invites us to draw this conclusion, we have to keep in mind that terms like modernity or postmodernity are difficult to generalize even in one country and even more so between countries. It is therefore necessary to continue the trajectory that this volume has undertaken through careful historical and political contextualization in order to grasp the individuality and specificity of future pilgrimages.

114 Ross 2011 [1978], xlii.

115 V. Turner and E. Turner 1978, 20.

116 Schrempf, this volume.

# Bibliography

- Adogame 2010**  
Afe Adogame. "From House Cells to Warehouse Churches? Christian Church Outreach Mission International in Translocal Contexts". In *Traveling Spirits. Migrants, Markets and Mobilities*. Ed. by G. Hüwelmeier and K. Krause. New York and London: Routledge, 2010, 165–185.
- Albera and Eade 2015**  
Dionigi Albera and John Eade, eds. *International Perspectives on Pilgrimage Studies: Itineraries, Gaps and Obstacles*. Routledge Studies in Religion, Travel, and Tourism 4. London: Routledge, 2015.
- Bachmann-Medick 2006**  
Doris Bachmann-Medick. *Cultural Turns. Neuorientierungen in den Kulturwissenschaften*. Hamburg: Rowohlt-Taschenbuch-Verlag, 2006.
- Baumann 2000**  
Zygmunt Baumann. *Liquid Modernity*. Oxford: Polity Press, 2000.
- Berg 1991**  
Eberhard Berg. "Communitas: Zur Brauchbarkeit eines einflussreichen Konzepts in der Erforschung des Pilgerwesens". In *Ethnologie im Widerstreit. Kontroversen um Macht, Geschäft, Geschlecht in fremden Kulturen*. Ed. by E. Berg, J. Lauth, and A. Wimmer. München: Trickster, 1991, 333–344.
- Berger 1992**  
Peter Berger. *Der Zwang zur Häresie*. Freiburg: Herder, 1992.
- Berriane 2014**  
Johara Berriane. *La zaouïa d'Ahmad al-Tijânî à Fès: pratiques, représentations et enjeux autour d'un sanctuaire soufi au rayonnement transnational*. PhD thesis. Freie Universität Berlin, 2014.
- Bowman 1985**  
Glenn Bowman. "Theoretical Itineraries towards an Anthropology of Pilgrimage". In *Dimension of Pilgrimage: An Anthropological Appraisal*. Ed. by J. Makhan. New Delhi: Inter-India Publication, 1985, 1–9.
- Bowman 1988**  
Glenn Bowman. "On Pilgrimage". *Anthropology Today* 4.6 (1988), 20–23.
- Bowman 2013**  
Glenn Bowman. "Christian Ideology and the Image of a Holy Land: the Place of Jerusalem Pilgrimage in the Various Christianities". In *Contesting the Sacred. The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf & Stock Publ., 2013, 98–121.
- Bynum 2011**  
Caroline Walker Bynum. *Christian Materiality. An Essay on Religion in Late Medieval Europe*. New York: Zone Books, 2011.
- Clifford 1997**  
James Clifford. *Routes. Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Coleman and Eade 2004**  
Simon Coleman and John Eade, eds. *Reframing Pilgrimage. Cultures in Motion*. New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Coleman and Elsner 1995**  
Simon Coleman and John Elsner. *Pilgrimage: Past and Present in the World Religions*. London: British Museum Press, 1995.
- Crain 1997**  
Mary M. Crain. "The Remaking of an Andalusian Pilgrimage Tradition: Debates Regarding Visual (Re)presentation and the Meanings of Locality in a Global Context". In *Culture, Power, Place. Explorations in Critical Anthropology*. Ed. by A. Gupta and J. Ferguson. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997, 291–311.
- Dahlberg 2013**  
Andrea Dahlberg. "The Body as a Principle of Holism. Three Pilgrimages to Lourdes". In *Contesting the Sacred. The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. Ed. by J. Eade and M. J. Sallnow. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 2013, 30–50.

**Desplat 2012**

A. Patrick Desplat. "Introduction. Representations of Space, Place-Making and Urban Life in Muslim Societies". In *Prayer in the City. The Making of Muslim Sacred Places and Urban Life*. Ed. by A. P. Desplat and D. Schulz. Bielefeld: transcript, 2012, 9–34.

**Dubisch 1995**

Jill Dubisch. *In a Different Place: Pilgrimage, Gender, and Politics at a Greek Island Shrine*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995.

**Dünne 2013**

Jörg Dünne. "Einleitung zu Teil IV, Soziale Räume". In *Raumtheorie. Grundlagentexte aus Philosophie und Kulturwissenschaften*. Ed. by J. Dünne and S. Günzel. Suhrkamp-Taschenbuch Wissenschaft 1800. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp, 2013, 289–303.

**Durkheim 1976**

Emile Durkheim. *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life*. London: Routledge, 1976.

**Eade and Sallnow 1991**

J. Eade and M. J. Sallnow, eds. *Contesting the Sacred. The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. London: Routledge, 1991.

**Eade 2009**

John Eade. "Reframing Pilgrimages: Contesting the Sacred in a Globalising World". In *Cities of Pilgrimage*. Ed. by S. Shahshahani. Berlin: LIT Verlag, 2009.

**Eade 2012**

John Eade. "Pilgrimage, the Assumptionists and Catholic Evangelisation in a Changing Europe: Lourdes and Plovdiv". *Cargo* 10.1–2 (2012), 29–46.

**Eade 2013**

John Eade. "Introduction to the Illinois Paper-pack". In *Contesting the Sacred. The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. Ed. by J. Eade and M. J. Sallnow. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 2013, ix–xxvii.

**Eade and Katić 2014**

John Eade and Mario Katić, eds. *Pilgrimage, Politics and Place-Making in Eastern Europe. Crossing the Borders*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2014.

**Eade and Sallnow 2013**

John Eade and Michael J. Sallnow. "Introduction". In *Contesting the Sacred. The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. Ed. by J. Eade and M. J. Sallnow. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 2013, 1–29.

**Eberhart 2015**

Helmut Eberhart. "From Religious Folklore Studies to Research of Popular Religiosity: Pilgrimage Studies in German-Speaking Europe". In *International Perspectives on Pilgrimage Studies: Itineraries, Gaps and Obstacles*. Ed. by D. Albera and J. Eade. London: Routledge, 2015.

**Eickelman 1976**

Dale F. Eickelman. *Moroccan Islam*. Vol. 1. Austin: Texas University Press, 1976.

**Evans 2003**

Mathew T. Evans. "The Sacred. Differentiating, Clarifying and Extending Concepts". *Review of Religious Research* 45.1 (2003), 32–47.

**Evans-Pritchard 1969**

Edward E. Evans-Pritchard. *Theories of Primitive Religion*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1969.

**Feldman 2007**

Jackie Feldman. "Constructing a Shared Bible Land: Jewish–Israeli Guiding Performances for Protestant Pilgrims". *American Ethnologist* 34.2 (2007), 351–374.

**Geissler and Prince 2013**

Paul W. Geissler and Ruth J. Prince. *The Land is Dying. Contingency, Creativity and Conflict in Western Kenya*. Epistemologies of Healing 5. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2013.

**Giddens 1992**

Anthony Giddens. *Die Konstitution der Gesellschaft. Grundzüge einer Theorie der Strukturierung*. Frankfurt a. M.: Campus, 1992.

**Girtler 2005**

Roland Girtler. *Irrweg Jakobsweg. Die Narben in den Seelen von Muslimen, Juden, Ketzern*. Graz: Steirische Verlagsgesellschaft, 2005.

**Goody 1961**

Jack Goody. "Religion and Ritual. A Definition Problem". *Journal of Sociology* 12 (1961), 143–164.

- J. Grimm and W. Grimm 1889a**  
Jacob Grimm and Wilhelm Grimm. *Deutsches Wörterbuch*. Bd. 13. Leipzig: Deutscher Taschenbuch Verlag, 1889.
- J. Grimm and W. Grimm 1889b**  
Jacob Grimm and Wilhelm Grimm. *Deutsches Wörterbuch*. 33 Bände. Leipzig: Deutscher Taschenbuch Verlag, 1889.
- Gutschow 2008**  
Niels Gutschow. "Begehungen und Umgehungen. Das Durchmessen von Raum durch Wallfahrten und Prozessionen". In *Prozessionen, Wallfahrten, Aufmärsche. Bewegung zwischen Religion und Politik in Europa und Asien seit dem Mittelalter*. Ed. by J. Gengnagel, M. Horstmann, and G. Schwedler. Köln: Böhlau, 2008, 399–436.
- Gutschow and Michaels 1993**  
Niels Gutschow and Axel Michaels. *Benares: Tempel und religiöses Leben in der heiligen Stadt der Hindus*. Köln: DuMont, 1993.
- Haller 2009**  
Dieter Haller. "Ethnologie/Sozialanthropologie". In *Raumwissenschaften*. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp Taschenbuch, 2009, 109–124.
- Heiser and Kurrat 2014**  
Patrick Heiser and Christian Kurrat, eds. *Pilgern gestern und heute. Soziologische Beiträge zur religiösen Praxis auf dem Jakobsweg*. Berlin: LIT Verlag, 2014.
- Hervieu-Léger 2004**  
Danièle Hervieu-Léger. *Pilger und Konvertiten. Religion in Bewegung*. Religion in der Gesellschaft 17. Würzburg: Ergon, 2004.
- Hill-Smith 2009**  
Connie Hill-Smith. "Cyberpilgrimage: A Study of Authenticity, Presence and Meaning in Online Pilgrimage Experiences". *Journal of Religion and Popular Culture* 21.2 (2009). DOI: 10.3138/jrpc.21.2.006.
- Hirschberg 1988**  
Walter Hirschberg, ed. *Neues Wörterbuch der Völkerkunde*. Berlin: Reimer, 1988.
- Huber 1999**  
Toni Huber. *The Cult of Pure Crystal Mountain. Popular Pilgrimage and Visionary Landscape in Southeast Tibet*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Jones 2007**  
Graham Jones. *Saints in the Landscape*. Stroud: Tempus, 2007.
- Kohl 2003**  
Karl-Heinz Kohl. *Die Macht der Dinge. Geschichte und Theorie sakraler Objekte*. München: C. H. Beck, 2003.
- Kurrat 2014**  
Christian Kurrat. "Biographische Bedeutung und Rituale des Pilgerns". In *Pilgern gestern und heute*. Ed. by P. Heiser and C. Kurrat. Münster: LIT Verlag, 2014, 161–192.
- Lefebvre 1991**  
Henri Lefebvre. *The Production of Space*. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1991.
- Lienau 2014**  
Detleff Lienau. "Mein Körper vibriert vor Dankbarkeit. Leibliche Erfahrung beim Pilgern". In *Pilgern gestern und heute*. Ed. by P. Heiser and C. Kurrat. Münster: LIT Verlag, 2014, 193–220.
- Löw 2001**  
Martina Löw. *Raumsoziologie*. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp, 2001.
- Luithle-Hardenberg 2011**  
Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg. *Die Reise zum Ursprung. Die Pilgerschaft der Shvetambara-Jaina zum Berg Shatrunjaya in Gujarat*. München: Manya, 2011.
- Merleau-Ponty 1962**  
Maurice Merleau-Ponty. *Phenomenology of Perception*. New York: Humanities Press, 1962.
- Morinis 1984**  
Allen Morinis. *Pilgrimage in the Hindu Traditions. A Case Study of West Bengal*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1984.
- Oliver-Smith 1999**  
Anthony Oliver-Smith. "The Brotherhood of Pain. Theoretical and Applied Perspectives on Post-Disaster Solidarity". In *The Angry Earth: Disaster in Anthropological Perspective*. Ed. by A. Oliver-Smith and S. M. Hoffmann. New York: Routledge, 1999, 156–172.

- Olwig and Hastrup 1997**  
Kenneth Olwig and Kirsten Hastrup. "Cultural Sites: Sustaining a Home in a Deterritorialized World". In *Siting Culture, the Shifting Anthropological Object*. Ed. by K. Olwig and K. Hastrup. London: Routledge, 1997, 17–38.
- Otto 1991**  
Rudolf Otto. *Das Heilige. Über das Irrationale in der Idee des Göttlichen und sein Verhältnis zum Rationalen*. München: C. H. Beck, 1991.
- Reuter and Graf 2014**  
Julia Reuter and Veronika Graf. "Spirituelle Tourismus auf dem Jakobsweg. Zwischen Sinnsuche und Kommerz". In *Pilgern gestern und heute*. Ed. by P. Heiser and C. Kurrat. Münster: LIT Verlag, 2014, 139–160.
- Rosa 2013**  
Hartmut Rosa. *Beschleunigung und Entfremdung. Entwurf einer kritischen Theorie spätmoderner Zeitlichkeit*. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp, 2013.
- Ross 2011 [1978]**  
Deborah Ross. "Introduction". In *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*. Ed. by V. Turner and E. Turner. New York: Columbia University Press, 2011 [1978], xxix–lvii.
- Sallnow 1987**  
Michael J. Sallnow. *Pilgrims of the Andes. Regional Cults in Cuzco*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1987.
- Scheer 2006**  
Monique Scheer. *Rosenkranz und Kriegsvisionen: Marienerscheinungskulte im 20. Jahrhundert*. Untersuchungen des Ludwig-Uhland-Instituts der Universität Tübingen 101. Tübingen: Tübinger Vereinigung für Volkskunde, 2006.
- Schlögel 2007**  
Karl Schlögel. *Im Raume lesen wir die Zeit. Über Zivilisationsgeschichte und Geopolitik*. Frankfurt a. M.: Fischer Taschenbuchverlag, 2007.
- Shahshahani 2009**  
S. Shahshahani, ed. *Cities of Pilgrimage*. IUAES Series 4. Berlin: LIT Verlag, 2009.
- Simmel 2013 [1903]**  
Georg Simmel. "Über räumliche Projektionen sozialer Formen". In *Raumtheorie. Grundlagentexte aus Philosophie und Kulturwissenschaft*. Ed. by J. Dünne and S. Günzel. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 2013 [1903], 304–316.
- Skar 1985**  
Harald Skar. "Communitas and Schismogenesis: The Anden Pilgrimage Reconsidered". *Ethnos* 50.1–2 (1985), 88–102.
- Soja 1989**  
Edwin Soja. *Postmodern Geographies. The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory*. London: Verso, 1989.
- Stausberg 2010**  
Michael Stausberg. *Religion in modernen Tourismus*. Berlin: Verlag der Weltreligionen, 2010.
- Taylor 2004**  
Philip Taylor. *Goddess on the Rise. Pilgrimage and Popular Religion in Vietnam*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2004.
- V. Turner 1969**  
Victor Turner. *The Ritual Process. Structure and Anti-Structure*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1969.
- V. Turner 1974**  
Victor Turner. *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1974.
- V. Turner 1989**  
Victor Turner. *Vom Ritual zum Theater. Der Ernst des menschlichen Spiels*. Frankfurt a. M.: Qumran Verlag, 1989.
- V. Turner and E. Turner 1978**  
Victor Turner and Edith Turner. *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1978.
- Walgate 2002**  
Wendy Walgate. *Narrative Cycles on the Hagia Triada Sarcophagus*. 2002. URL: [http://www.walgate.com/pdf/WendyWalgate\\_HTSEssay.pdf](http://www.walgate.com/pdf/WendyWalgate_HTSEssay.pdf) (visited on 31/07/2017).
- Werbeck, Galling, and Campenhausen 1959**  
Wilfrid Werbeck, Kurt Galling, and Hans von Campenhausen, eds. *Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart*. Vol. 3. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1959.

**Werbeck, Galling, and Campenhausen 1961**

Wilfrid Werbeck, Kurt Galling, and Hans von Campenhausen, eds. *Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart*. Vol. 5. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1961.

**Werbner 1996**

Pnina Werbner. "Stamping the Earth with the Name of Allah. Zikr and the Sacralizing of Space among British Muslims." *Cultural Anthropology* 11.3 (1996), 309–338.

**UTE LUIG**

was professor of Social Anthropology at Freie Universität Berlin from 1990 to 2010 and dean of the Department of Political and Social Sciences (2006–2008). Within Excellence Cluster Topoi she acted as principal investigator (PI) of research group C-III, *Acts*. Among her many interests African religions and spirit possession predominated, see *Spirit Possession, Modernity and Power in Africa*, ed. by Heike Behrend and Ute Luig, Oxford 1999.

Prof. i.R. Dr. Ute Luig  
Teutonenstr. 24  
14129 Berlin, Germany  
E-Mail: luig@zedat.fu-berlin.de